

ESTABLISHMENT OF A BRANCH SYNDICATE AT
ALLAHABAD.

READ the following extract, paragraph 12, from a letter, No. 2279, from the Secretary to the Government of the North-Western Provinces, dated 9th December, 1868, forwarded for the consideration of the Syndicate by the Government of India, with endorsement No. 611, dated 30th October, 1869.

“Holding these views, the Lieutenant-Governor does not concur with Mr. Kempson in regretting that a classical language has been made imperative in the superior University Examinations, but His Honor would have added Persian to the number. His Honor would also be glad to see honors given by the University for proficiency in the Oriental classics to students who had already proved that they possessed a competent knowledge of English. In the orders of the Administration Report for last year, His Honor remarked in this sense: ‘If the prospect of honors in the Oriental classics could be held out to such as had succeeded in passing, say the middle University Examination, it might tend to lead those who, by a fair English education, have acquired precious stores of European knowledge to prosecute the Oriental studies which would qualify and fit them for communicating those treasures to their fellow-countrymen in an elegant vernacular style, and in conformity with Native modes of thought and illustration.’”

MINUTE BY THE VICE-CHANCELLOR OF THE CALCUTTA
UNIVERSITY.

THE sentiments of the Lieutenant-Governor of the North-Western Provinces, on the subject of extending the influence of the Calcutta University to the North-Western Provinces, have been laid before the Syndicate, and as the subject is one

which demands, on many grounds, serious attention, I venture to submit my own ideas on it at some length for the consideration of the Syndicate.

Broadly, the success of the University in Bengal, especially in the neighbourhood of Calcutta, and the importance of the results which have followed its establishment, can scarcely be over-rated. On the other hand, it is, I believe, equally beyond doubt that its influence is very far from being as strong, or its success as great, with regard to the Provinces of North-Western India. This fact is fully borne out by the testimony of Sir William Muir, which, both as to the fact and its causes, is so important that I venture to reproduce it at length, together with the remedies which he proposes.

“ But though not prepared to advocate the immediate establishment of an University in these Provinces, the Lieutenant-Governor is not the less sensible that the Calcutta University does not fully and satisfactorily meet the wants of this part of the country. And it is possible that some concessions might be made by that body, which should not only prove immediately beneficial, but pave the way, when the time shall have fully come, for an independent University in the North-West.

“ The first point to be noticed which affects the influence of the University on the affiliated Institutions, and, through them, the whole Educational system of these Provinces, is the fact that they are not represented in the Senate. There are but three members of the Senate belonging to the North-Western Provinces,—one is the present Director of Public Instruction, Mr. Kempson; and the second, his predecessor in that office, Mr. H. S. Reid; the third is the Lieutenant-Governor himself; but it is significant that although, as stated by you, Sir W. Muir has ‘ long taken special interest in such questions,’ His Honor never had any connection with the Council till he became an *ex-officio* Fellow on being appointed a Member of the Supreme Government. There is not a single Native gentleman belonging to this Government

in the Senate, and it may be said that these Provinces are practically unrepresented in that body.

“ This has arisen no doubt from the circumstances that the Senate, to be of practical use under the present constitution of the University, must be composed of persons in Calcutta or its vicinity, who, from their position, can take a personal share in the deliberations and proceedings of the Faculties and Syndicate. It was probably felt that, to appoint Fellows, resident at a distance, would be to confer an empty distinction on persons who could do little to influence the action of the University, and that the measure was unnecessary.

“ There may have been little detriment in the early years of the University from this arrangement, for the wants of the country were yet undeveloped. But this is no longer the case. These Provinces are now beginning to assume an importance in Collegiate matters which, in view of its special circumstances and requirements, as distinct from those of Bengal Proper, demands a fair and effective representation in the counsels of the University.

“ For a while, this want might be supplied if the University were prepared to adopt the suggestion, supported by Mr. Kempson, for the constitution of a branch of the Senate in these Provinces. The Governor-General in Council can, under Section 6 of the University Act, appoint for the North-Western Provinces, Oudh, &c., extra Fellows beyond the number of 30. There seems nothing in the law, or in the constitution of the University, to prevent the delegation by the Senate of authority for such Fellows to meet at Allahabad for the purposes of consultation, and of advising the Senate in all matters regarding the North-Western Provinces. And, similarly, the business of conducting the examination of all persons belonging to these and adjoining Provinces, who may present themselves for examination at Allahabad, might be carried on by this branch of the Senate. Upon their report the Senate would proceed to grant its degrees.

“ Further, there is no reason apparent why a Convocation might not be held at Allahabad for the conferment of degrees granted by the Senate. The dislike of the Natives of these Provinces to the metropolis of Bengal is so great, that it is with the utmost reluctance they proceed thither ; and consequently, at the yearly Convocations, from which it is rare to find a successful Bengali student absent, the North-Western competitor seldom, if ever, appears. His name is announced, but no one comes forward to receive the diploma. The legitimate stimulus which is given by the *éclat* of the Convocation is thus lost to the North-Western Provinces. But it would be gained with double effect if the titles of the University were conferred at a local Convocation amidst influences and associations far stronger to the Native of these parts than any which Calcutta can afford.

“ There remain two points for consideration,—first, whether greater encouragement might be advantageously given to the study of Oriental literature ; and secondly, whether any part of the examinations might not be conducted in the Vernacular.

“ The Lieutenant-Governor would not support any scheme which did not make proficiency in English a condition of obtaining degrees. It is not high scholarship, simply as such, which is to be promoted and rewarded ; rather it is scholarship of a kind that shall benefit the nation by raising its intellectual and moral standard, and conduce to its material and social advancement. It needs little argument to show that these ends are not to be looked for from the unaided prosecution of Oriental learning. As tersely and to the truly put by Mr. Kempson, such study ‘ produces a people who may talk beautifully, but who think and write most inaccurately.’ And, further, it is only by the acquisition of English, that the student can find his way to those stores of knowledge without which his fine writing is mere verbiage, for the most part worse than useless. The day, we may hope, will come when Oriental literature shall contain in itself some

of those essential materials for which we are now solely dependent upon the languages of the West ; but till then no large national benefit can be looked for from the encouragement of Oriental studies apart from English.

“ For these reasons the Lieutenant-Governor thinks that the system of requiring a certain proficiency in English, as the condition of University training and University distinctions, is sound and unassailable ; but it may be that the condition is pushed too far and made too stringent. By the present rules no honors in Oriental literature can be secured until the student shall have passed the B. A. standard. But to produce a beneficial action upon the national mind, it is perhaps too much to require so severe a standard in English and in science. The great want of the people is a vernacular literature,—works in History, Art, and Science, containing sound knowledge, written in an elegant style, and composed on models of thought and expression agreeable to the Native mind. For this end, a body of students is needed, who, by the study of the Oriental classics, shall possess the faculty of composing in such a style, and high proficiency in Oriental literature itself requiring much study, can hardly be looked for in combination with the very high standard in English and in science required for the B. A. Degree. It is, therefore, a matter for serious consideration whether a greater national benefit would not be secured by offering Honor Degrees in the Oriental languages to students of a certain lower standard in English and in science, than as now by insisting on the pre-requisite of a B. A. degree. For example, such degrees might, perhaps, be given to students who devote themselves to Oriental literature after having passed the “ Middle Examination.” Certainly, the knowledge of English literature and of science, necessary for the passing of that examination, supposes the power in the student of availing himself of the stores of European knowledge in a sufficient measure for the production of translations, compilations, or original works containing valuable information drawn from those stores.

The great desideratum of the day would be by this means more likely to be compassed. The Vernacular languages would be enriched by the compositions of scholars whose style would be formed upon the best Oriental models, and modes of reasoning and expression would be in accord with native thought, who would yet have access through the English language to the knowledge of history, art, and science; and who, being, as we may hope, imbued with the love of true learning, would be at the same time in the best position to communicate the fruits of their own studies in a native and attractive form to their fellow-countrymen.

“ On the second point, the remarks of Messrs. H. S. Reid and M. S. Howell are deserving of attention. It is certain that the sciences can be conveyed with far greater accuracy of thought to a Native student in his own vernacular than through the too often indistinctly apprehended texts of an English treatise. It is also certain that many text-books, those at least relating to the exact sciences, are capable of comparatively easy translation; and we have already some good treatises, both translations and original works, on these subjects in the vernacular. There is also, as the Lieutenant-Governor has had opportunity of personally observing, a great mass of students throughout these Provinces who, though educated only in the vernacular, have yet attained considerable proficiency in mathematical science. It is not pretended that as yet we are ready for conducting University examinations in any subject in the vernacular; but His Honor believes that the time is not very distant when such a course will be possible and expedient, and when the interest of the Native students will demand it.

“ The establishment of a corresponding branch of the Senate at Allahabad might prove of essential service in the settlement of these and similar questions connected with the important object of accommodating the University to the varying and growing requirements of these outlying Provinces,

and, as before suggested, it would serve to smooth the path for the eventual constitution of an independent University in the North-West.

“ If the Governor-General in Council should concur in the soundness of the views attempted to be expressed in this despatch, His Excellency may see reason to communicate the same to the Senate for such action as they feel at liberty to take in respect of them.”

Accepting, as I think must be done, this testimony, and it is supported by the testimony of Messrs. Kempson, M. S. Howell, H. S. Reid, quoted by the Lieutenant-Governor, to which I may venture to add that of my own experience, it must be allowed that the Calcutta University has not yet exercised its due influence in the North-Western Provinces. The causes of this failure remain to be examined.

Practically, it will be seen that Sir W. Muir attributes it to two causes, *viz.*, the constitution of the governing body of the University, and the mode in which the proceedings of the University are conducted ; and, *secondly*, to the discouragement given by the present (and still more by the past) system of University Examinations to the study of vernacular languages.

The Lieutenant-Governor proposes certain changes to meet these defects.

Before dealing with his proposals *seriatim*, I would wish to offer a few remarks on the relative importance of the causes assigned.

I venture to think, however, that in assigning the first ground of dissatisfaction as a cause which has hitherto mainly operated disadvantageously to the interests of this University in the North-Western Provinces, the Lieutenant-Governor and the gentlemen by whose authority he is supported have perhaps overstated the case. If, as is alleged by the Lieutenant-Governor, some changes are now expedient in the modes of teaching enforced by the University, it may

be yet fairly doubted if such changes would not have hitherto proved premature, and it is at least probable that they would not have been adopted at an earlier day even if the North-Western Provinces had enjoyed the fullest share of influence claimed for it in the Councils of the University.

At the same time, there can be no doubt that a very strong feeling has recently grown up not merely among the gentlemen employed in the Educational Department of the North-Western Provinces, but amongst others both of the official and non-official community, Natives as well as Europeans, who are interested in the progress of education, that some opportunity should be allowed to them of giving expression to their opinion, at least regarding the more important questions which are decided by the University, and which greatly affect the character and success of educational measures as well as in the North-Western Provinces as elsewhere. Perhaps the expediency of making some change in the laws of the University to meet, as far as possible, this feeling may be admitted without further discussion.

No question will, I imagine, arise as to the propriety of giving, as far as possible, to all those who are interested in education over the area to which the operations of the University extend a voice in its deliberations.

I now proceed to treat of the Lieutenant-Governor's definite proposals on this part of the subject. The first of these, which is not perhaps very clearly expressed, is contained in the Lieutenant-Governor's 10th paragraph. So far as I understand, it amounts to the virtual creation of a branch Syndicate at Allahabad, "for the purposes of consultation and advising the Senate in all matters regarding the North-Western Provinces," and also for the virtual conduct of examinations at Allahabad. I cannot think that the Lieutenant-Governor, in making this proposal, quite appreciated the present method of carrying on the business of the University. At any rate, I believe that to give to a purely local body any degree of authority specially in reference to

local matters, would very materially impair the uniformity of action which is absolutely essential to the success of the University ; and it would, moreover, I feel assured, give room for very great diversity of opinion and to grave risks of dissension. For this reason, it seems to me impossible to assign to the Fellows of the University resident out of Calcutta any special authority even in local matters other than that which they already possess by the Statutes of the University.

The only alterations which I would recommend to the Syndicate have for their object to facilitate the real exercise of their present nominal powers by non-resident members of the Senate. In giving these in detail, I do so with some hesitation, and shall be quite prepared to accept any modifications of them which may be suggested, and which may leave them equally efficient for securing their object.

Briefly, my proposals are to this effect, that every subject submitted to any Faculty for discussion should be circulated to all the members of such Faculty, resident or non-resident, for, say, six weeks before the meeting of the Faculty at which it is to be discussed, and that it shall be competent for any member to forward to the Registrar a Minute to be read at such meeting, and to vote by proxy upon any proposition discussed.

Provided, however, that it shall at such meeting be competent to the Faculty, instead of proceeding to a direct vote on the subject discussed, to adjourn the meeting for a period of not less than one month, and, if necessary, to cause the Minutes submitted, or any of them, to be printed and circulated to the members of the Faculty, on the understanding, however, that no member of such Faculty shall be at liberty to record any further Minute after the first meeting of the said Faculty.

The object of the suggested rule is to give an opportunity to non-resident members to record their opinions and their votes on any subject brought before the Faculties. No doubt

the proposal would, if adopted, occasion some little delay in the discussion of questions by the Faculties, and would give rise to some slight increase of expense for printing and postage.

The expense, however, would be a point of no moment in view to the advantages which would be gained, and as regards delay, the proposal to limit the submission of Minutes to the *first* meeting of the Faculty is intended to prevent the delay which results from interminable counter Minutes ; while the permission to print and re-circulate any of the Minutes presented is intended to give the Faculty the power of bringing to the notice of absent members any important suggestions or arguments which such Minutes may contain, and which the meeting may consider it expedient should have fuller consideration. In fact, I believe that, on one or two occasions, a method of consulting distant authorities not very dissimilar to that proposed has been adopted by the Faculties. To meet, however, extraordinary occasions, the Syndicate might be vested with the power of suspending this rule ; or, if it be thought necessary, its operation might be limited to cases involving matters of principle or general interest, such for example as alterations in the standard for examinations, &c., &c.

It might, I think, also be possible to adopt a similar method of procedure in regard to meetings of the Senate held under the 13th Bye-law to discuss the decisions of the Syndicate.

If these proposals be adopted, they would ensure to non-resident fellows the fullest practicable share in all the more important deliberations of the governing body of the University, and accord to them the full share of influence which they can legitimately claim.

The Syndicate, as an executive body, required for prompt action, must, I think, always be composed of resident members, and cannot be limited or controlled in the exercise of its powers by any separate co-ordinate body.

I would here mention that it has been suggested to me by a member of the Senate that it would be convenient to provide, in case of the temporary absence of the Vice-Chancellor from Calcutta, for the appointment of a *locum tenens*, as is done in respect to the members of the Syndicate by the 4th Bye-law. The subject is one on which I do not offer an opinion, but as for the last seven years the Vice-Chancellor has been regularly absent from Calcutta for a considerable period in each year, it will be for my colleagues to say how far any inconvenience has practically resulted from this fact, and whether it is likely that any countervailing inconvenience would result from the frequent changes in the incumbents of the Vice-Chancellorship which would follow a modification of the existing rules, such as that now suggested. If the measure, however, be considered expedient, it seems to me that the nomination should rest in the Vice-Chancellor, to be confirmed by the same authority by which the Vice-Chancellor himself is appointed.

The next proposal of the Lieutenant-Governor relates to the holding of a branch Convocation at Allahabad. The argument for this proposal is that, as a rule, the graduates from the North-Western Provinces are rarely able to attend the Convocation in Calcutta, and that, in consequence, the operation of the University in the North-Western Provinces is practically deprived of the solemnity and emphasis which the annual meeting of the Senate in Convocation affords. I am not prepared to dispute these arguments, and I have no doubt that the proposal is one which may be carried out at a very small expenditure of money, and with very little inconvenience to the Registrar and Vice-Chancellor, whose attendance in Convocation will, I presume, be necessary. The question is one, however, on which I do not profess to entertain any very strong opinion.

I now proceed to discuss the third proposal made by the Lieutenant-Governor of the North-Western Provinces, *viz.*, that greater encouragement should be given to the study of

Oriental literature and larger employment be made of the Vernacular as a medium of teaching. The question involved is one of very great delicacy and importance, and one on which, no doubt, there is room for great diversity of opinion. After stating briefly, therefore, the suggestions of the Lieutenant-Governor, I must ask the indulgence of the Syndicate while I explain somewhat at length the extent to which I recommend the adoption of Sir W. Muir's proposals, and the reasons for which I do so. The Lieutenant-Governor's views will be found in the 13th, 14th, 15th, and 16th paragraphs of his letter already quoted above.

Before proceeding further upon the subject, it should be clearly understood that neither the Lieutenant-Governor (as he clearly explains), nor, so far as I am aware, any advocate of his views, is in the least prepared to depreciate the value of English teaching. On the contrary, the proposals of the Lieutenant-Governor are expected to operate practically to its greater encouragement, and it is on this ground alone that I am prepared in any degree to recommend them to the Syndicate as I shall presently show.

The methods which the Lieutenant-Governor suggests for attaining his objects are practically as follows :—*viz.*, to allow undergraduates who have passed the First Arts Examination to present themselves as candidates for Honors in the Oriental languages ; and, secondly, to raise teaching through the medium of the Vernacular in the zillah and high schools gradually to a standard which will enable students to read in the vernacular up to all the various standards of University Examinations, and, if I understand rightly, the Lieutenant-Governor desires that these examinations themselves should be optionally held in the vernacular. As the correspondence, however, is in the hands of the Syndicate, I will not endeavour further to set out the Lieutenant-Governor's proposals and agreements, and have only done so to the above extent that I may make my own more clear.

I may perhaps at once say that, while sharing generally Sir W. Muir's opinion, I cannot entirely follow his proposals, which seem to me, in some respects, to go beyond what can ever be necessary, and in others to be at least premature. Before, however, stating what I would suggest in modification of these proposals, I proceed to explain and support the views which a rather long connection with the educational system of Government has led me to entertain on this subject, and which I venture to place before the Syndicate for their consideration. In doing so, however, I would disclaim all sympathy with the "Orientalism," which was overthrown, and deservedly overthrown, some five and thirty years ago; *that*, as the members of the Syndicate are fully aware, was an attempt to make the classical languages of the East the media for conveying European knowledge. The scheme was from the first certain to fail, for there was nothing in those languages, as actually constituted, which could so impart that knowledge, and it would have taken centuries to create, in a dead language, or what was practically a dead language, a literature representing even the bare outlines of European literature and of the accumulation of scientific knowledge; and meanwhile hundreds and thousands would have been set laboriously to the pursuit of a study which, beyond the bare mental exercise which it involved, and the comparative mastery which it gave them over their own language, would have been absolutely useless.

It was therefore wisely determined to make English the key which was to unlock the stores of European knowledge, at least in their fulness, and to use the vernaculars at first only as the means of conveying instruction of a very simple and elementary nature. But it is clear that between that full knowledge of English which gave a student the power of teaching himself from European sources and the elementary education imparted in the vernacular, there was always a wide gap. It was certainly the policy of the despatch of 1854 that this gap should eventually be filled by improved

instruction in the vernaculars, and this was, in fact, avowed in so many words.

The question to be now solved, therefore, is, whether the time has arrived for any advance in this direction.

There is I think, a good deal which may be accepted as proof that the time has arrived, at least in the North-Western Provinces; a considerable desire for advanced education has unquestionably been shown among a certain class, both in the North-Western Provinces and the Punjab, who have not acquired, and are not likely to any great extent to acquire, English. It is only natural that this should be the case; it is the invariable result of education of any class to create a desire for something more; and, moderate as has hitherto been the standard of vernacular education, it has no doubt acted more or less in this sense. Moreover, the acquisitions which not a few of the young men of the Upper Provinces have made through the means of the English language have stimulated the legitimate ambition and desires of those who have known them or watched their careers.

But, on the other hand, the study of English has not made, and it may be said is not likely soon to make, such progress in the North-Western Provinces as it has done in Lower Bengal. Many of the motives which have stimulated its progress there are absent in the North-Western Provinces, while obstacles which are unknown in Bengal retard its progress in the North-Western Provinces. Not the least of these obstacles has been, that we found in the North-Western Provinces, far more than in Bengal, a system of indigenous education still busy and active which, however narrow in its limits and imperfect in its modes, was still sufficient to give an intellectual training by no means despicable, and which was current and popular among a very large and influential class, whose influence was yet further increased by the fact that they were, until very lately, the only possible instruments of carrying on the administration. It is, perhaps, one reason for the slow progress, too, of English education, that its advocates have

somewhat unduly and, as the people felt, unjustly, depreciated the culture which was familiar and endeared to the popular mind.

Be this, however, as it may, there can, I think, be no doubt, from the evidence of those who are best qualified to judge, that a very strong desire for Western education has recently made itself felt in the North-Western Provinces, but that it is checked and retarded by the condition which virtually makes the English tongue the sole medium of such education,—a result which practically follows mainly from the present scheme of University teaching.

It might be even fairly asked whether we should be justified in insisting on the maintenance of a condition of this kind, the effect of which is to hinder materially the progress of education, and to deprive large numbers of its benefit, even if the result of any relaxation of existing rules were to be a discouragement more or less to the study of English. But it may, I think, be confidently expected that no such result will ensue. The desire for information and education once encouraged will satisfy itself, I have no doubt, where alone it can be fully satisfied at all, in the study of English literature* and of English science, and I believe that a marked stimulus will thus be given to the study of English, more particularly if, as I shall proceed to suggest, a good knowledge of English is made a necessary condition to the attainment of Honors and of the higher degrees. Should the proposals which I shall have the honor presently to submit be adopted by the Syndicate, I shall be very much disappointed indeed if the result is not very shortly seen in a large extension of English education in the North-Western Provinces.

What I have said above chiefly has relation to that part of the Lieutenant-Governor's proposals which deals with furtherance of education by means of the vernaculars. As

* The material advantages which a knowledge of English confers should not be forgotten. It is already almost an absolute condition of high official advancement, and will soon, perhaps, be almost equally indispensable in matters of commerce.

regards the encouragement of the study of the Oriental classical languages, I argue with the more confidence, inasmuch as the University has, in fact, by recent changes, to some extent, acknowledged the necessity for such a measure.

If the standard of education among a people is greatly raised, their language must feel the effects of the movement; a literature both scholastic and general will arise, and the language will expand and fit itself to meet the requirements of this literature in a way which the natural genius, character, and affinities of the language itself will mainly determine.

There can be little doubt that the source from which the greatest additions to the vernaculars of this side of India must be derived are the classical languages of the Eastern world. Experience has already demonstrated this; there can be no doubt, for example, that modern Oordoo has enriched itself, and is daily enriching itself, from Arabic and Persian sources. Indeed, the Lahore Committee on Examination Books recently spoke in strong condemnation terms of modern Oordoo on that very ground. On the other hand, Bengalee, I am assured, has, within the last thirty years, enormously increased its Sanscrit element, and has mainly rejected what it used to contain of Persian and Arabic to the very great improvement of the language. Personally I have no knowledge of Bengalee, but I have heard this assertion repeated more than once both by Native and European scholars. If these facts be undisputed, then they point very strongly to the free encouragement of the critical study of the classical languages as an accompaniment of a general advance in vernacular education,—the critical study, that is, in contra-distinction to the cumbrous and unprofitable mode of studying them which is indigenous, and which is calculated (perhaps purposely as regards Sanscrit) to repel rather than to aid and encourage the student.

If, however, I fully understand the arguments of those who oppose all encouragement to the study of the classical lan-

guages of India, they are adverse to giving any facility for improving the vernaculars, partly because of their diversity, partly because they hope to see the English language the language of learning in India, enriching and perhaps, at length, assimilating the vernacular language by additions from its own wealth of expressions.

But if any vernacular continue to exist, as no doubt it will always, the result of imparting more fully general knowledge and instruction must be, as has been indicated above, to improve, enrich, and expand it, and this process will certainly be guided by natural laws, the ultimate result of which may be uncertain, but which the utmost endeavours of Government will have little power to control artificially. How much this is the case, and how little chance English has of becoming the "learned language of India," may be gathered from the recent progress of the Bengalee language already cited. The last thirty years, during which it is said to have been enriching itself so largely from Sanscrit sources, has been precisely the period in which enormous efforts have been made at great expense and with remarkable success to spread English education in Lower Bengal. It is not, perhaps, too much to say that the really good English scholars in Bengal have, during all this period, been out of all proportion more numerous than the Sanscrit scholars, the study of which language has received, indeed, but poor encouragement; and yet, while a very great number of words have been fully adopted from the Sanscrit, it may be questionable if a single English word has been naturalized in Bengalee; and yet modern Bengalee literature is, beyond doubt, largely indebted to English models and to English science.

It seems probable that nothing would make English the "learned language" of India short of its compulsory enforcement as the sole medium of all education (except purely elementary education), and of judicial and other official business. Possibly not even this would suffice, and yet merely to insist on it as the vehicle of conveying education would, as

has been seen, debar a large number, possibly even the majority, of those who seek education from pursuing it to any length, and this would surely be most unfair and unjust as well as impolitic. In fact, the mere political disadvantages of such an endeavour to compel the use of English would enormously outweigh the advantages which could be gained by its success, for these at best are remote and dubious.

While, therefore, I think that a long period of time, so long that it is useless to speculate about anything beyond it, English must be an indispensable constituent of all higher education in India, nevertheless I agree with Sir W. Muir in believing that the standard of teaching in the vernacular should be considerably, though gradually, raised above the standard which now exists, and that simultaneously more encouragement should be given to the study of the classical languages of India.

As regards the first, I would only propose, certainly at present, that examinations for the Entrance Examination should be optionally conducted in the vernacular.

I would not, I think, relax the rule which requires a Bachelor's degree as a condition of taking honors in the Oriental languages. It will, I think, be sufficient encouragement to give in all the examinations a somewhat higher value to the marks in these languages, and to permit them to be substituted for English in the *Entrance Examination* only. The reasons for which I would suggest these two steps, which I admit may at first sight appear anomalous, is this :—As has been said, a very large number of students are deterred by the enforced necessity of learning English from coming at all within the sphere of European teaching. They go on in the old groove, which is unimproved, and almost unimprovable. This is specially the case in Upper India with the Mahomedan population, and I need hardly say that the result is an unmixed political evil.

But if it were possible for students to pass by any acknowledged University standard, even the lowest, without the

condition of learning English, I feel certain that a very considerable number of those now excluded would, in other respects, fit themselves for the examinations.

To replace, however, even the bare intellectual training which results from the study of English, some substitute must be found, and I feel assured it will be best found in the substitution of a higher standard of teaching in the Oriental classical languages.

Briefly, therefore, I would propose that the Entrance Examination be held optionally in the vernacular, and optionally also the languages to be taken up should be English, one Vernacular, and one Oriental classical language as at present, or one vernacular and a higher standard of attainments in either Sanscrit or Arabic. I believe, I may say, that some such scheme as this has been in times recommended by each of the present Directors of Public Instruction in the Punjab, North-Western Provinces, and Oudh. There are, I am aware, physical difficulties in the way of giving effect to these proposals, and it would, I dare say, be five or six years before much advantage was taken of them. The preparation of books for higher standards of vernacular teaching, and the introduction of such teaching into schools, would take some time. But as regards books, I may say with some confidence, that a very little management would soon produce them in ample number to supply the demand. The Allygurh Society and other similar societies, especially one at Lucknow, would, I have reason to know, give active aid. There are persons qualified for the task of translating, adapting, and preparing books in greater numbers than would be at first suspected; such, for example, as some of the superior Native officers of the Educational Department who have retired upon pensions, and I believe that a very little encouragement on the part of Government, such as certainly Sir W. Muir would always be ready to give, would suffice to produce all that is needed in this respect.

Examiners might be more difficult to find. Still even now it would not be impossible; the field of selection, indeed, might

be somewhat limited at first, but this difficulty would gradually grow less and less.

The Lieutenant-Governor is, I believe, quite ready to raise the standard of teaching in the vernacular as rapidly as can be done, up to the standard of the Entrance Examination, and I have no doubt that if the University adopts some such course as that I have indicated above, a very few years will see a large advance in Vernacular, and, I believe, also in English education in Upper India.

I venture, therefore, to commend these proposals to the favourable consideration of the Syndicate, feeling very confident that if carried they will greatly extend the influence of the University and increase its popularity, and that they will very materially accelerate the progress of European education especially among classes who have held aloof from it, and whose alienation is a great misfortune both to themselves and to the interests of good administration, and a serious hindrance to the social improvement of the country.

FROM OFFICIATING SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT,
N.-W. P., TO REGISTRAR OF THE CALCUTTA UNIVERSITY,
No. 2725A., DATED NYNEE TAL, THE 27TH JUNE, 1870.

SIR,—I AM directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 1462, dated the 21st February last, with which you forward a Minute by the Vice-Chancellor of the Calcutta University, on the subject of a proposed modification of the University system for the North-Western Provinces.

2. In reply I am to say that the officers named in the

Mr. M. Kempson, M. A., Director of Public Instruction, North-Western Provinces.	margin,
Mr. Deighton, Principal, Agra College.	who were
„ Sime, Professor, Agra College.	deemed
„ Reid, Board of Revenue.	the most
Hon'ble C. A. Turner.	competent
Mr. Hume, C. B.	to advise
„ Griffith, Principal Benares, College.	the Go-
Baboo Siva Prasad, C.S.I., Joint Inspector of Schools.	
Mr. M. S. Howell, C.S., late Officiating Inspector of Schools.	
„ Templeton, Principal, Bareilly College.	

Mr. Harrison, Professor, Bareilly College.

" Jardine, Professor of Law.

Reverend C. E. Vines, Principal St. John's College, Agra.

Mr. C. A. Elliott.

vernment

on the im-

portant

topics raised by the Vice-Chancellor, having been consulted, their replies are now forwarded for submission to the Senate.

3. Before entering on the discussion opened up by Mr. Bayley's paper, the Hon'ble the Lieutenant-Governor would express his gratification that the Vice-Chancellor has so readily and fully admitted the special wants and requirements of these Provinces, and the obligation devolving on the Senate to do what is practicable to meet them; and also that the Senate itself has taken the question so promptly in hand.

4. The opinions now forwarded will be found to contain much that is suggestive, the result evidently of earnest thought on the part of those who are best qualified by a knowledge of the subject, and many of them by long experience, to offer practical and valuable advice.

5. On the questions advanced, I am now to furnish you with the views of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor.

6. *First*: On the proposed establishment of a branch of the Senate at Allahabad.

7. His Honor's sentiments on this subject have been so fully and accurately interpreted in the majority of the papers now submitted that little remains to be said upon it. I am to refer especially to the Minutes of the Officiating Chief Justice, Mr. Turner, Mr. H. S. Reid, Junior Member, Sudder Board of Revenue, Mr. C. A. Elliott, Officiating Secretary to Government, and to the letter of the Director of Public Instruction. The object in view of the Lieutenant-Governor was distinctly stated in paragraph 10 of Mr. Simson's letter of the 6th May, 1869, to be "the delegation by the Senate of authority for Fellows (resident in the North-Western Provinces) to meet at Allahabad for the purpose of *consultation*, and of *advising the Senate* in all matters regarding "the North-Western Provinces;" and although it was suggested that the conduct of the local examination might be committed

to this branch of the Senate, it was added that, "upon their report *the Senate* would proceed to grant its degrees." Thus it is clear that no separate or independent authority was contemplated. Indeed, no such authority could be exercised without a change in the law, since Section 10, Act II. of 1857, lays it down that all questions "shall be decided at a meeting of *the Senate* by the majority of members present;" and the Lieutenant-Governor distinctly stated that, what was suggested by the Government, North-Western Provinces, could (as he conceived) be attained under the existing law.

8. So far then as the objections apprehended, in respect of this proposal, by the Vice-Chancellor are concerned, it is hoped that the explanation now offered may obviate them. His Honor entirely shares the opinion of those who hold that the ascertainment of individual opinion from Fellows scattered in various parts of the Provinces will not answer what is required. What is needed is an organized consultative body, which can meet periodically, discuss the various questions affecting the special wants of this part of the country, reconcile divergent opinions, and offer, in a mature and complete form, the final result of their deliberation. Such advice, coming from a body charged with these responsible functions, would evidently carry far more weight, and possess a higher intrinsic value, than the separate notes and suggestions of individual Fellows.

9. On this head, therefore, I am to say that the Lieutenant-Governor adheres to the original proposal.

10. On the *second* suggestion for the holding of a Convocation at Allahabad, His Honor cannot add anything to the views expressed in the enclosures of this despatch.

11. On the *third*, for lowering the English standard in favour of those who seek for honors in Oriental literature, I am desired to say that Sir William Muir concurs generally in the views advanced by Mr. Kempson.

12. The object to be aimed at in the conferment of scholastic distinctions is to advance the nation in Science.

Arts, and Morals. For this end, individual merit is rewarded by the appropriate honors ; but a higher and larger purpose than mere individual distinction is intended,—namely, the development of a body of scholars who shall have passed through such a discipline as will best qualify them to influence their countrymen for good, and thus render them effective agents in raising the moral sense and intellectual culture of the nation. And for this end familiarity with Oriental learning and indigenous modes of thought is indispensable.

13. An Indian youth, educated from childhood in Europe, may return to his native land with all the accomplishments of an University training, and yet, equally with the foreigner, lack the aptitude for influencing his countrymen. This would be an extreme case. But the same defect may, in greater or less degree, be witnessed every day. Knowledge is communicated to our students through a foreign medium, explained by foreign illustration, and inculcated by foreign maxim. Their habits of thought choose channels strange and uncongenial to the native mind. There are few common points of system or idea between our scholars and the people, and little sympathy of intellect. Their mind has set in an alien mould. The tree long trained in another direction will at last refuse any approach to its natural bent.

14. But not only so. This system must tend to check development. If the medium of explanation and illustration be foreign, the range of the learners' ideas becomes limited and confused. New ideas are explained by foreign phrases, imparting probably ideas equally unfamiliar. Precision of thought, and the play of imagination, are thus sacrificed or seriously impaired. It is easy to conceive how limited and imperfect would be the range of an English boy's ideas, whose learning was communicated solely through the medium of Latin or of Sanskrit. If teaching be not in the language in which the pupil thinks, and illustration by objects and associations with which he is conversant, intellectual development becomes dwarfed and stunted.

15. These are the principles which have guided the Lieutenant-Governor in the proposals submitted to the Government of India.

16. In the first place he sought that encouragement should be given to the acquisition of Oriental learning on the ground-work of an English education. Believing it to be beyond the reach of ordinary students to achieve great proficiency in Oriental studies *pari passu* with the continued study of English literature, His Honor would wish to see only the ground-work of the latter insisted upon. That once laid, the key of knowledge has been gained, and an effectual corrective against the unscientific processes and puerilities of Oriental literature. To secure an Oriental training it appeared, and still appears, to His Honor that the test of English literature might be dropped after the second examination. The student would thus be free to devote his undivided energies to Oriental literature. The tests in History from some English text book might, however, be retained as suggested by Mr. Kempson.

17. The proposal by the Vice-Chancellor to dispense with English at the Entrance Examination is open to the objections taken to it in most of the enclosures. The concession would not be availed of by those who have learned in English; and those who have not learned in English at the age in question, would then be too old to take up the study.

18. His Honor is in favour of vernacular examination where the provision of text-books sufficiently admits. This would be the case to a large extent in Mathematics and Algebra; probably as yet in no other branch. But the Lieutenant-Governor, for the reasons already given, is strongly in favour of the rendering and explanation of English studies being allowed in the vernacular. As urged by Mr. Kempson, and as attempted to be shewn above, explanation and illustration should at the time of teaching be in the youth's own language; and examination should follow the same course.

19. The Lieutenant-Governor also concurs with the Director of Public Instruction in holding that, after a certain point in the University Examination, the student should be allowed to take up for honors branches of Oriental literature bearing on Logic and Ethics. The study of these would be an equal test of mental activity and power with that of European authors; while it would familiarize the student with the modes of Oriental thought and argument, improve his style, and enrich his vocabulary. Honors might even be given for profound acquaintance with certain of the Oriental historians, a class which Mr. Kempson thinks we should avoid. The Persian Historians of India might be studied with advantage; and although in some of its aspects, Arabian History does not furnish the political lessons it may be most expedient to put before the Mussulman student, yet the objection may be over-strained. There are chapters from the pen of Arabian Historians than which few others (His Honor is disposed to think) are more suitable for the Indian student. Those, for example, which tell of the conquest of Sicily and of Spain by the Moors, and of their eventual expulsion, and which have engaged the labours of such scholars as Amari and Dozy, would have the special benefit of shewing at what points the history of the East touches that of the West; and the study might even lead the scholar on to a wider application of his critical canons, and to test by them the vast confused mass of myth, fact, fable, and fiction, which he is at present taught to regard as history. Sir William Muir can think of no object more worthy of the labours of an Indian University than thus to rouse the people from their dreamy notions of the past, and so lead them on to the recognition and study of real history.

20. To advise the means by which such objects might be attained would be one of the duties of the Allahabad Branch Senate. And I am, in conclusion, to say that the movement that has recently taken place in these Provinces towards the establishment of a Central College at Allahabad would, His

Honor hopes, materially aid any project of the kind now advocated which the Senate may be pleased to entertain. That important and growing city now offers the materials for a strong and capable College Council, and the members of the same might be utilized for the purposes of the University, both as a consultative and examining body, by being appointed Fellows, and empowered to meet as a Branch Council at Allahabad.

21. The proposals for this Institution, towards which a sum of above £17,500 has already been subscribed, are now before the Supreme Government. In aiding this fund, several native Princes to the West and South of these Provinces have joined, although Oudh has as yet contributed nothing to the movement.

22. It is proposed that the College buildings should embrace a Hall in which Convocation might fitly be held; its class-rooms would also be available for the University examinations. Connected as the Institution would thus be, both in respect of its building and its Council, with the University, it might not be premature to style it an University College. And the Lieutenant-Governor looks earnestly to the Senate and Vice-Chancellor to give the project in this form the aid of their powerful advocacy.

I have, &c.,

(Sd.) C. A. ELLIOTT,
Offg. Secy. to Govt., N.-W. P.

FROM DIRECTOR, PUBLIC INSTRUCTION, TO OFFICIATING
SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT, N.-W. P., No. 340, DATED
ALLAHABAD, THE 16TH MAY, 1870.

SIR,—WITH attention to G. O. No. 56B., dated 7th March, 1870, I have the honor of submitting twelve Memoranda on the Vice-Chancellor's Minute, which have been

contributed by Members of the Senate of the Calcutta University, resident in the North-Western Provinces, and by officers of position engaged or interested in the education of the country.

The Memoranda are printed in the order of their dates, and

- | | |
|--|----------------|
| 1. MR. DEIGHTON, Principal, Agra College. | the names of |
| 2. " SIME, Professor, Agra College, Member of the Senate, Calcutta University | the contribut- |
| 3. " REID, Board of Revenue, Member of the Senate. | ors are given |
| 4. HON'BLE C. A. TURNER, Chief Justice. | in the mar- |
| 5. MR. HUME, Commissioner, Member of the Senate. | gin. One |
| 6. " GRIFFITH, Principal, Benares College, Member of the Senate. | half of these |
| 7. BABOO SIVA PRASAD, Joint Inspector of Schools, Member of the Senate. | gentlemen |
| 8. MR. M. S. HOWELL, Judge of Small Cause Court, Dehra, late Officiating Inspector of Schools. | are Members |
| 9. " TEMPLETON, Principal, Bareilly College. | of the Senate |
| 10. " HARRISON, Professor, Bareilly College. | of the Calcut- |
| 11. " JARDINE, Professor of Law, Member of the Senate. | ta Univer- |
| 12. REV. C. E. VINES, Principal, St. John's College, Agra. | sity. The |

papers of all combine to form a valuable basis on which to construct a more exact estimate of the educational question than has yet been put forward in connection with University teaching for Upper India. The two main particulars of change in the present system, which were advanced as desirable in His Honor's address to the Government of India, and which have been, to some extent, agreed to by the Vice-Chancellor, receive powerful support and illustration in most of the Memoranda; while there is at the same time a general wish to avoid rash or premature action.

In submitting my own views on the points under discussion, I propose in what follows to refer to the sentiments expressed by the several writers, without attempting a general review, which would be out of place where the object is to have the opinions of the gentlemen who have been consulted exactly as they have given them.

2. The two points in which the interest of the discussion centres are :—(1), an improved representation of the interests

of the Upper Provinces in the University Councils; (2), a change in the curriculum suited to meet the peculiar wants of the people of Upper India, as compared to the inhabitants of Bengal Proper.

I take these in order, though the second is incomparably the more important. It is, in fact, the need of change, and the ways and means of carrying sanctioned changes into effect alone, that make an adequate representation of those interested a matter of necessity.

3. The Vice-Chancellor's Minute foreshadows the willingness of the Senate to accept proposals for an improved representation of the interests of the Upper Provinces in the University Councils; but a fear of interrupted action, if not of discord, inclines him to view with disfavour the proposed formation of a Branch Syndicate. Mr. Bayley, I think, misunderstands the purport of this proposal. Encroachment on the prerogative of the Calcutta Syndicate, or any usurpation of its executive power, was not intended. Changes were mooted towards the management of which it was felt that local aid was indispensable, and the Branch Syndicate was to give this aid. Mr. Turner, I notice, is strongly of opinion that the formation of a Branch Syndicate by no means implies that broken uniformity of action which Mr. Bayley deprecates, and with regard to absolute uniformity he gives the following excellent caution:—"If by absolute uniformity the benefits which might otherwise result from the University are contracted, then uniformity, so far from being essential, is in fact injurious to the success of the University." Mr. M. S. Howell sees much advantage in a local centre at Allahabad, in subordination to the Calcutta body, and would hail its formation as a necessary measure of decentralising tendency. Mr. Sime, believing that the University should be more of a living reality in this part of its jurisdiction, would like to see some exercise of local influence, and suggests monthly meetings of resident members of the Senate at Allahabad. Messrs. Deighton, Harrison, and Jardine consider that the operations of a Branch

Syndicate at Allahabad would tend to ultimate severance from the Calcutta University; but the latter holds this opinion on the hypothesis that the proposed Branch Syndicate would exercise functions similar to those exercised by the Calcutta Syndicate, and the first-named gentleman seems to me to show much misconception of the case when he implies that a share in the University Councils is after all more a matter "of sentiment than of practical importance." Mr. Hume on the other hand does not understand "why a Branch Syndicate should not be *avowedly* created," for actual and not virtual effect. He considers that "the ruling powers of the Calcutta University are not cognizant of extra-Bengal educational requirements;" and that as the Calcutta Syndicate is a local body, so there should be other local bodies for other local interests. With respect to uniformity of action he says wisely that it "may be pushed beyond the limits of usefulness." Mr. Vines would "like to see a branch of the Syndicate of the Calcutta University meeting at Allahabad, having full powers for the arrangement of studies and conduct of examinations, so far as they affect peculiarly and exclusively these Provinces."

4. It will be observed that the Vice-Chancellor's fear of disunion, if a Branch Syndicate is established beyond the limits of Calcutta, is re-echoed by three only of the gentlemen whose opinions have been asked. One of these is indifferent to the question of representation, and the other two base their opinion partly on a misconception of the proposal made, and partly because they think that the Vice-Chancellor's alternative of increasing the numbers of the Senate and calling for written opinions meets the case. I think it may easily be shown that the interests of the Upper Provinces can be adequately represented in no other way than by the election of resident members of the Senate to a seat in the Syndicate of the University. Bye-law No. 12 empowers any member of the Senate to make a recommendation to the Syndicate. Bye-law No. 13 subordinates the decision of the Syndicate to the

Senate itself. But Bye-law No. 14 says : " No question shall be considered by the Senate that has not, *in the first instance*, been considered and decided on by the Syndicate." How can even a partial change of system to meet peculiar wants be " considered and decided on," and thereafter represented to the Senate in a satisfactory manner by a Syndicate which consists of members, who, as Mr. Hume says, are not cognizant of the facts of the case? It may be said that the Calcutta Syndicate will learn the facts by the Minute system proposed by the Vice-Chancellor, but surely in questions which involve the social interests of large communities, legislation by persons who have not seen with their eyes and heard with their ears, however well they may have been supplied with facts, is likely to be unsympathetic at the least, and may be worse. The only way to deal satisfactorily with local interests is to delegate power, under proper check, to local representatives. The only way to effectuate changes intended to meet local peculiarities is to use the offices under proper check of local agents. The Branch Syndicate, which perhaps had better have been called the Sub-Syndicate, was intended to do the double duty of representing local interests, and of aiding the University to meet them. As Mr. Vines well says : " To watch the time and amount of change required is the work of a local body,—*i. e.*, one acquainted with, and resident in the provinces which will be affected by proposed changes."

5. I observe that Mr. Reid takes the same view of the case. He recommends that two members of the Senate, taken from residents at Allahabad be elected to the Syndicate; *ipso facto* these two members would be a Branch or Sub-Syndicate, and, with a Sub-Registrar to conduct correspondence and to keep accounts, would be in a position to give invaluable aid to their Calcutta colleagues; especially if the changes which form the second part of this discussion receive the sanction of the University. Indeed, it is difficult to see how a Calcutta Syndicate could give effect to the modifications proposed without the help of partner-agents at the provincial capital.

6. Convocations at Allahabad are approved by all. The conferment of degrees on the spot would bring home the reality of the University, and would be a convenience to all concerned. But as yet no suitable buildings exist for the purposes of convocation and examination, though their provision cannot be long delayed.

7. Turning to the second part of the subjects of Sir William Muir's communication, and Mr. Bayley's Minute thereon, it is obvious that the changes under discussion depend on a right appreciation of the educational necessities of the Upper Provinces. It is a great point to have gained the Vice-Chancellor's sympathy. *Primâ facie* there is no reason why the University of Calcutta should not legislate for a

* *Vide* preamble of Act II. of 1857 :—"It has been determined to establish an University at Calcutta for the purpose of ascertaining, by means of examination, the persons who have acquired proficiency in different branches of Literature, Science, and Art, and of rewarding them, &c., &c."

part of its jurisdiction in a way which, though not required under the circumstances of the Presidency town, is not forbidden by the Charter.* If "proficiency in different branches of Literature, Science, and Art" is restricted to mean proficiency in English Literature, English Science and English

Art, Act II. of 1857 is inconsistent with the spirit of the Despatch of 1854, which looks to the eventual possibility of

† *Vide* paragraphs 12, 13, 14.

higher education in the vernacular.† But the meaning of the Charter is, I conceive, virtually so restricted. The Calcutta University requires proficiency in an Oriental classic, among other classical languages for choice in the B. A. standard, but it requires far higher standard of proficiency in English Literature. The History, Philosophy, and Morals are all in English. The Science is English, and must be taken up in English. This system of examination presented no difficulty in the Lower Provinces,‡ for it was based on the existing school curricula. But at the time when Bengal was ripe for the University, the Upper

‡ Compare the remarks in Despatch of 1854, paragraphs 86-87.

Provinces were ripe for insurrection. More than one section

* I remember at one important town the rebel authorities gave notice that all who knew English should have their hands cut off if they dared to put pen to paper. of the community were impatient of control, and men's minds were unsettled by a seditious agency. The feeling was essentially anti-English.* When the lesson of the

mutiny had been learned, a re-action in favour of English undoubtedly set in; but the characteristics of the people remain the same. With more manliness than the mass of the population of Bengal, they combine a child-like veneration for old things. The Rajpoot never tires of his ancient traditional lore, or the up-country Brahmin of his sacred books. The Mussulman is unfaithful if he gives English the preference to Arabic. He gains no respect for being an English scholar if he has neglected Persian Literature. Large sections of the population adhere resolutely to their old teachings, and decline to accept novelties, however recommended. They say:— "Why not teach this or that?" "Our Grammars are as good as yours." "Our *Muntiq* suits us as well as your logic suits you." "Why should we not be taught so and so in the vernacular?" And so on.

This feeling of independence is a trait of character we would rather utilise than crush. We would meet the people half-way, and insisting on English as a *sine qua non* in Government schools of the upper class, and as the only real means of importing fresh ideas and creating advance of thought, we would encourage the old love for the country literature, and look to the vernacular as the medium through which new ideas and thoughts may reach the masses.

It is to enable the Calcutta University to extend its usefulness by attaching a full meaning to its Charter, and to give it elasticity rather than to impair its effectiveness, that we ask for a modification of system, and a Branch Syndicate to aid in carrying out the details.

8. With regard to the modification of system suggested in the correspondence, Sir W. Muir's original proposals

receive general support in comparison with the Vice-Chancellor's amendments, and few fail to notice the impracticable nature of one of these, *viz.*, that which relates to the position of English in the matriculation test. English cannot be an *optional* subject of examination there if it is to be taken up with advantage as an essential part of the First Arts course. The particulars of change have not been considered in detail by any but Mr. Reid, whose valuable Memorandum is No. 3 of the series. My own views will be given below, but before approaching that part of the subject, I wish to glance at the general considerations put forward in the Memoranda, many of which are far-seeing and well-weighed.

9. The papers submitted by educational officers are unanimous on two points: first, that English must remain as before the staple of University teaching; and, secondly, that premature severance from the Calcutta University would be a greater evil at present than a rejection of the modifications proposed. None feel this more strongly than the Principal of the Agra College, some of whose statements over-shoot the mark a little, and betray what I cannot but consider a want of sympathy with local necessities. The paramount position of English in any really regenerative system of education is admitted by all; but this is no reason why Oriental literature and the vernacular should be excluded from their proper position as a part of University teaching in a section of the University's jurisdiction which cannot do without them. Especially with regard to the vernacular to say, as Mr. Deighton says, that vernacular education is merely a local business which it is beneath the University to take account of is tantamount to saying that the circumstances of the Upper Provinces are not materially different from those of Bengal, and that we may disregard the popular voice or have wrongly interpreted it. To stigmatise the expression of a desire for some modification of system which shall give better play to local taste as a confession of inability to compete with the Bengali is absurd: rather, as Mr. Griffith says, we base our advocacy of

change on "the abstract principle of justice." Mr. Griffith is of opinion that the study of English will not be injuriously affected by the changes proposed. Mr. Turner believes that it will be extended, basing his calculation on the present observed repugnance of the Mahomedans to study English without a proportionate attention to Oriental learning.

The Principal of the Benares College is far more hopeful than his colleagues of the good which will arise from consulting the obvious wish of part of the community, by giving more encouragement to Oriental studies in University education. He says: "The classical languages will be more extensively and accurately studied, the vernacular will gain rapidly in copiousness, refinement, and strength, and the great and ever increasing demand for text books in Literature, History, and Science will produce a class of works which at present can scarcely be said to exist."

10. Mr. Harrison would not abandon English as one of the subjects for the B. A. degree; but hints at the possibility of replacing one or more of the other branches of study in the course, such as History, Psychology, or Mathematics, by a prescribed selection of Oriental classics. Mr. Vines writes to the same effect. With regard to the vernacular, both are of opinion that it is placed at a disadvantage under the present University system, in which the student learns only English, and one of the classical Oriental tongues. The students cannot be supposed capable of *thinking in English*, and a disability which places them at a disadvantage in acquiring knowledge may fairly be removed by a concession which should make it optional for them to use the vernacular in acquiring special knowledge. We should achieve, as Mr. Harrison says, "a double gain in accustoming our students to think in their own vernacular and in the earlier and more complete comprehension of strict processes of reasoning."

11. Mr. Templeton shows his sympathy with the movement when he says:—"Any change short of that very complete one of teaching English as a language only, giving History,

Philosophy, and Mathematics in the vernacular, would be of little practical use."

Both he and Mr. Harrison are of opinion that, as yet, the class of students who attend our Colleges are not likely to care for Oriental studies as such. A great end would be gained if we could induce the wealthier classes to come within the influence of the University curriculum by manifesting a disposition to consult their tastes in the choice of subjects.

Messrs. Jardine and Sime are equally averse with Messrs. Harrison and Vines to giving up the B. A. test as it stands, but differ from them in lacking sympathy with the possibilities of vernacular education. Mr. Jardine implies that a "revival of learning" can be introduced only by the agency of native scholars, educated under the existing system—an opinion which makes the discussion of change in his view all but unnecessary. He, therefore, must be held to side with the Principal of the Agra College in declining to attach significance to popular feeling among the natives. "The social problem," as Mr. Jardine says, "should not be allowed to degenerate into a linguistic problem," but the caution can hardly apply to an attempt to correct our treatment of the former under the varying conditions which it presents in various localities. On the other hand, I am inclined to think it does apply to those who would force English on the country at all hazards as the *summum bonum*. Mr. Jardine expresses the aims of an earnest well-wisher to the country when he says:—"It is not a style and a taste moulded upon the masterpieces of Persian and Sanscrit poetry that the people of India want; it is rather that they should be introduced to a truer science, a higher morality, and a more inspiring history than their own." But surely the introduction of these things to the native mind will be effected far more thoroughly and broadly through the mother tongue of its many millions than by a foreign vehicle.

12. With regard to the details of change which, as before said, have not been approached by all the writers of the

Memoranda, Messrs. Reid and M. S. Howell are prepared to abide by His Honor's proposal to dispense with English as a necessary qualification for the B. A. degree. I side with both these officers, but have something to say further on as to the character of the English teaching up to the First Arts stage, because the possibility of relinquishing English thereafter depends much upon the quality of the proficiency required in that examination. On this point I notice some valuable suggestions in Mr. Sime's paper, but it should be borne in mind that our object is "to educate, and not merely to teach English" (*vide* Memo. No. 12). Mr. Reid, whose special qualifications for handling the question I need scarcely name, draws the following pithy estimate of the tuition compass of a College course:—"Our Anglo-Vernacular Colleges should turn out scholars possessed of a sound classical knowledge of English; a thorough acquaintance with the Grammar and idioms of their own vernacular; a sound classical knowledge of the Oriental language cognate to their vernacular; and, lastly, that amount of general information and scientific knowledge which every man who has received a liberal education is expected to possess." *Memo. 3, para. 17.*

The following is the outline course which he recommends for adoption in connection with the views embodied in his Memorandum:—

Entrance Examination.

- (1). English.
- (2). Arabic or Sanscrit; elementary.
- (3). Vernacular—to be tested by a prescribed course or study, and Grammar.
- (4). History, Geography, and Mathematics, which the candidate may take up in the vernacular.

First Arts Examination.

- (1). English.
- (2). Arabic or Sanscrit.
- (3). History, &c., as for the Entrance Examination.

B. A. Examination.

As now, except that candidates for Honors in Oriental languages may dispense with English, and may pass in History, &c., in the vernacular.

The only objections to which I think Mr. Reid's scheme is exposed are two:—(1), proficiency in Persian, which is as much an accomplishment to the Hindoostani gentleman as French is to the Russian, is not provided for.

(2). It seems too serious a demand on the candidate for matriculation to require him to pass in *three* languages.

13. The modifications which I have myself to propose do not differ very materially from Mr. Reid's outline. I have added explanatory remarks where necessary, and the existing scheme is placed alongside for reference.

ENTRANCE EXAMINATION.

*Existing scheme.**Proposed scheme.*

I.—LANGUAGES.

I.—LANGUAGES.

English and one of the following languages:—

Greek,	Bengalee,
Latin,	Ooria,
Arabic,	Hindee,
Persian,	Oordoo,
Hebrew,	Burmese,
Sanscrit,	Armenian,

Any other language may be added to this list by the Syndicate.

Sentences in each language in which the candidate is examined shall be given for translation into the other language.

The papers in each language shall include questions on Grammar and idiom.

(1). *English.*

I do not like the system of selections. I would name the authors or portions of authors only. The main test of a student's acquaintance with his author should be *ability to translate any part, prose or poetry, into the vernacular*, instead of the objectionable exercise of explanation by paraphrase which is now the chief means of rating his proficiency. Knowledge of Grammar and idiom are best tested by *ability to translate from the vernacular into English*. Neither of these tests have been used to any

sufficient extent in the University Examinations.

(2). *One of the following languages :—*

Greek.	Arabic.
Latin.	Sanscrit.
Persian.	

Greek and Latin are retained to meet the wants of European students. Native students should understand that they are not for them.

Proficiency in Persian, Arabic or Sanscrit should be tested by ability to translate any portion of the authors chosen into elegant Oordoo or Hindee, so far as the North-Western Provinces are concerned. I would avoid "Selections," which native scholars have no fancy for.

Critical knowledge of these languages should be tested by special papers.

II.—HISTORY.

The Outlines of Ancient History, of the History of India, and of general Geography, with a more detailed knowledge of the Geography of India.

The Historical text books will be fixed from time to time by the Syndicate.

II.—HISTORY AND GEOGRAPHY.

The History and Geography of India, general Geography in outline.

The elements of Physical Geography.

These subjects to be taken up in English or his vernacular, at the option of the candidate. No text books need be fixed. They will be compiled in the vernacular as wanted.

III.—MATHEMATICS.

Arithmetic.—The four simple rules; Vulgar and Decimal Fractions; Reduction; Practice; Proportion; Simple Interest; Extract of Square Root.

Algebra.—The four simple rules; Proportion; Simple Equation; Extract of Square Root; Greatest Common Measure; Least Common Multiple.

Geometry.—The first four books of Euclid, with easy deductions.

III.—MATHEMATICS.

Arithmetic.—The whole. Questions to be answered in the vernacular at the option of the candidate.

Algebra.—Up to Quadratic Equations, including Surds. In the vernacular at the option of the candidate.

Geometry.—Euclid, Books I.—IV. and VI. with Riders. To be taken up in the vernacular at the option of the candidate.

FIRST EXAMINATION IN ARTS.

Existing scheme.

I.—LANGUAGES.

English and one of the following Languages:—

Greek, Hebrew, Sanscrit, Latin, Arabic.

Proposed scheme.

I.—LANGUAGE. S.

(1.)—*English.* Printed extracts to be discontinued. The authors or parts of authors only to be named. The test of proficiency to be ability to translate into the vernacular, and not as now to write from memory a formal paraphrase.

Any other classical language may be added to the list by the Syndicate. Sentences in each language in which the candidate is examined shall be given for translation into the other language.

The papers in each language shall include questions on grammar and idiom.

Grammar and idiom to be tested by ability to translate from vernacular authors of medium difficulty into English, and by special critical papers.

(2.)—One of the following languages :—

Greek.	Arabic.
Latin.	Sanscrit.

Proficiency in Arabic and Sanscrit to be tested by ability to write translations in the vernacular, just as in Greek and Latin by ability to translate into English. Grammar to be tested by special papers.

Printed extracts to be eschewed, and the authors and parts of authors only to be named. *Passages should also be set with which the student is not supposed to be familiar.*

II.—HISTORY.

The History of England.

The test book to be fixed from time to time by the Syndicate.

II.—HISTORY.

The same to be taken up in the vernacular at the option of the candidate. Physical Geography.

(History by Oriental historians must, I think, be avoided.)

The Historical questions shall include questions relating to the Geography of the countries to which they refer.

III.—MATHEMATICS, PURE AND MIXED.

Arithmetic, Algebra.—(The following in addition to the subjects at Entrance):

Quadratic Equations; Proportion and Variation; Permutation and Combination; Arithmetical and Geometrical Progressions; the Binomial Theorem; Simple and Compound Interest; Discount; Annuities; the nature and use of Logarithms.

Geometry.—(The following in addition to the subjects at Entrance:—)

Euclid, Book VI. Book XI. to prop. 21. Deductions.

Plane Trigonometry as far as the Solution of Triangles.

Mechanics.—Composition and Resolution of Forces; Equilibrium of Forces at a point in one plane.

The Mechanical powers; Centre of Gravity.

III.—MATHEMATICS.

Algebra.—The whole.

Geometry.—Euclid, Book XI-1-21.

Geometrical Conics.

The Theory and practice of *Logarithms*.

Plane Trigonometry.—Up to Solution of Triangles.

Mechanics as before.

The whole of the above course to be taken up by the candidate in his vernacular if he chooses.

IV.—MENTAL AND MORAL
PHILOSOPHY.

Mental Philosophy as in
Abercrombie on the intellec-
tual powers.

Moral Philosophy as in
Abercrombie on the Moral
Feelings.

(N. B.—A modification of
this has been recently sanc-
tioned, by which a choice of
authors is allowed.)

IV.—MENTAL AND MORAL
SCIENCE.

As before; but I would
leave it optional with the
candidates from Upper India
to take up instead the system
of oriental ethics contained
in the Akhlaq-i-Jalali.
Akhlaq-i-Mohsini.
Akhlaq-i-Nasiri.

in a vernacular form.

To this might be added the
elements of *Mantiq* or *Nyaya*
in a vernacular dress.

14. It will be observed from a comparison of the above schemata as regards English, (1) that the present system of printed extracts is condemned. English texts of all kinds are easily procurable now, and the student who is in possession of the authors selected has a means of private reading and self-improvement which he would not otherwise trouble himself to procure; (2) explanation by paraphrase is eliminated to some extent by the proposal to require renderings in the vernacular.

The paraphrase system does positive harm, and is only conceivable on the ground that the teacher or examiner is ignorant of the vernacular. No one expects an English boy to *paraphrase* Virgil or Homer, Livy or Thucydides, as a proof of his appreciation or comprehension. It is obvious that he would gain nothing, and only spoil the original.

(3). Much emphasis is laid upon translation.

15. As regards History and Geography, an addition is made by introducing the elements of physical geography, and

it is left with the student to say whether he will be examined in English or the vernacular.

As regards Mathematics, the like option is given, and the standards of both examinations are somewhat raised.

As regards Moral Science in the First Examination in Arts, I have suggested the most popular studies of the kind in Upper India as an alternative with the existing scheme, which confines the student to English or Scotch theories. The ethics of the Arabian philosophy are as useful as western theories in the way of mental training. They are exact and systematic, and probably come originally from the same fount. As moral training they are perhaps equally useless.

The ethics of Sanscrit philosophy would be an excellent subject of examination, but they have yet to be popularized. *Mantiq*, again, is highly and deservedly esteemed by Mahomedan scholars in Upper India. I say without hesitation that I think the system will pass comparison with logic in English as a mental science, and it is vastly more congenial to Oriental taste. Hindoo logic yet remains to be popularized.

16. The F. A. Examination is a two years' course of study; and the student who passes it may be held to have gone through a fair elementary mental training, to which one year's further probation *in statu pupillari* is required to be added in which he may qualify himself for the B. A. degree.

If, as I think, a practically useful knowledge of English may be acquired by teaching it in the way which I have delineated in my proposed scheme, further examination in English for the B. A. degree may be left optional with the candidate, provided in lieu thereof he takes up an advanced course of Arabic or Sanscrit. Under present circumstances, I do not think that the student who has passed the First Arts Examination, especially in the 2nd or 3rd Divisions, is sufficiently master of English to enable him to resort to its stores of information and science alone and willingly. I would not, therefore, yet remove it from the B. A. standard.

17. In the matter of History for this standard, I would, for the first time, utilise the candidate's knowledge of English by requiring him to take up History in English. We should thus bring his English into play when he was able to express himself fairly ; but care should be taken to name authors of reputation and not mere compilers of facts, in order that the benefit of a good model might not be lost to the student. This would avoid the difficulty of putting western names and titles into an Oriental dress, which would be embarrassing if History continued to be studied in the vernacular.

18. For Mathematics, if it was thought necessary to continue the course, I would adhere to the present standard, with the option of passing in the vernacular. But I am very decidedly of opinion that it is not fair to withhold the B. A. degree, as is now the case, from all who cannot compass the Mathematical portion of the test. A young man without some natural turn for the subject finds it extremely toilsome to scrape through the Arithmetic, Algebra, and Euclid alone, with a minimum mark in the Entrance and F. A. Examinations. It will be easier for him in his own vernacular perhaps, but it is a positive bugbear when he has to cram up a distasteful subject beyond those elements. I would, therefore, allow all candidates in the B. A. (*and perhaps in the F. A. Examination*) to take up one of two subjects, *viz.*, either the Mathematics, or the Philosophy and Logic, which latter subjects should, for the B. A. Examination, take the form of a suitable extension of the F. A. requirements.

The case is very similar to the restriction which was in force at Cambridge only a few years back. No classical scholar, however splendid his attainments, could sit for the examination in classical honors unless he passed, in the first instance, through the examination for mathematical honors. This was an effectual bar to many men of known linguistic ability and literary taste who had no turn for mathematics. The restriction was removed, and the classical honor list became larger year by year.

19. My scheme, then, for the B. A. Examination implies *proficiency* in three points.

(1.)—In a classical Oriental language.

(2.)—In History (*in English*).

(3.)—In Mathematics.

or in Philosophy and Logic (English or Oriental).

For a B. A. degree in honors I would demand *high proficiency*.

I have, &c.,

ALLAHABAD :	}	(Sd.) M. KEMPSON, M. A.,
16th May, 1870.		Director of Public Instruction, N.-W. P.

MEMORANDUM No. 1.—By K. DEIGHTON, ESQ., *Principal, Agra College*.

IN the few remarks I am about to make on the changes now under the consideration of the University, I shall follow the order in which they have been set forth by Sir W. Muir, and discussed by Mr. Bayley.

The first question is, whether to officers in these Provinces there should not be given a larger representative share than they now have in the councils of the University, together with the power in certain matters to act independently of the Senate and Syndicate in Calcutta.

To take the last part of this question first, the plan of a Branch Syndicate, invested with functions of local Government, appears to me to carry with it all the dangers and disadvantages which Mr. Bayley fears. Indeed, however we may wrap up the fact in words, such a scheme virtually amounts to a complete severance from the Calcutta University. The time when the North-Western Provinces will be in a condition to ask for a Charter of its own is probably still far in the future.

And until it arrives, we who derive so great a benefit from being connected really and not nominally with a University like that of Calcutta cannot but suffer from any plan which

shall deprive us of the counsel of men able and experienced, and lend to that which should be one and uniform the look of division and patch-work, without resolving ourselves into a local body, in which our own narrow interests would assume an undue importance. It is quite possible to make known to the Senate the peculiar wants of these Provinces, and to advise that body upon matters with which it is sometimes imperfectly acquainted.

Again, it is a high honor now for a student to be able to write against his name the title of B. A. in the University of Calcutta. But degrees granted by a separate set of Examiners, and granted to student's competition, among whom would be limited to the small number sent up from the Colleges of these Provinces, would lose much of their value in public estimation. It would obviously be impossible to give our students a choice as to the Board before which they would appear, for the Colleges could not afford to lecture to a double set of candidates in each year's class. We should, therefore, be taking away from the more ambitious that chance of distinction in early life which the present conditions of the University hold out, and be giving distinct shape to the idea that the inhabitant of the North-Western Provinces is unequal to competing with the Bengali.

Moreover, there would be no security whatever that the standard of examination would remain the same at both centres. For, though the papers in the North-Western Provinces were modelled on those set in Calcutta, it could never be guaranteed that the system of marking was identical. After a few years, I am convinced that our high water-mark would be found to have fallen. The knowledge that we have to match ourselves with the Colleges of Bengal acts upon us, the teachers, as well as upon the students, our pupils; and, this stimulus withdrawn, I believe that our exertions would in a measure abate. I do not of course mean that a Professor would designedly lower the level which he had formerly striven to reach; but insensibly there would follow a deterioration from which we

are now saved. It is but human nature that it should be so ; and they who are acquainted with Oxford and Cambridge know well what was the state of those Colleges which, till lately, were shut out from Triposes open to the general body of under-graduates.

I do not myself recognize the evil which it is sought to cure by having this separate Board of Examiners at Allahabad. But, supposing it to exist, I believe that the remedy proposed would but lower the *morale* of our Colleges, and at the same time injure the worldly prospects of our pupils.

As regards our share in the councils of the University, it may, perhaps, be well that these provinces should be more fully represented than has hitherto been the case. I confess, however, that I look upon the matter rather as one, so to speak, of sentiment than of practical importance. It is possible that the natives of these provinces would feel a more lively interest in the Calcutta University if they believed that they could perceptibly influence its policy. But, in the real working of the system, it is not likely that an active part would be played by non-resident Fellows unconnected with the Educational Department.

Mr. Bayley's proposals regarding the submission and circulation of Minutes seem to me to give us nearly all we need. It has long been the custom for the Registrar of the University to ask the opinion of Heads of Colleges on such matters as the percentage of lectures which a candidate should be called upon to attend ; the age which he must reach before presenting himself for examination ; the proportion of marks to be allotted to each subject ; the propriety of altering the text-books ; the best means of checking superficial teaching ; and so on. And I have no doubt that the answers sent in to such enquiries, as well as the uninvited suggestions which we have, at times, thought right to make, have received every consideration they deserved. It might be well that the opinions offered by those to whom reference is made should be strengthened by the right of voting ; and if such rights can

attach only to a Fellow of the University, I can easily believe that the Senate will recommend to the Viceroy that each College in these provinces should have a voice in its deliberations. Agra and Benares are already thus represented, while at Allahabad the Director of Public Instruction and the Professor of Law are both on the list of Fellows.

The proposal to hold at Allahabad a convocation for the purpose of conferring degrees seems to me one that may well be pressed. Such spectacles, no doubt, do, as it is right they should, influence the native mind ; and those whom no argument could convince will often yield to the persuasion of ceremonial display. The rule by which it was made compulsory upon B. A. students to present themselves for Examination at Calcutta was framed, I believe, with some such object as that which Sir W. Muir hopes, and with better reason, to effect by a local convocation. And though it was certainly hard that a candidate, just before examination, should be called upon to take so long a journey, it is not very much to expect of successful competitors that they should come for the conferring of their degrees to the capital of the provinces to which they by birth belong.

The next question for consideration is how far the Calcutta University can assist, first, towards giving to the study of Oriental Literature an encouragement which has hitherto been denied to it ; and, secondly, towards promoting the diffusion, by the vernaculars, of that knowledge of Western Art and Science which at present can be gained but through the medium of the English language.

To effect the first of these two purposes, Sir W. Muir would allow a student, after passing the F. A., to proceed to the Honor Degree in one or other of the classical languages of the East, without continuing his study of the subjects laid down for the B. A. Examination,—*viz.*, English, Mathematics, Philosophy, History.

Mr. Bayley, while still requiring that the B. A. degree should be first obtained, would give “in all the examinations a some-

what higher value to the marks in these (the Oriental) languages," and would "permit them to be substituted for English in the *Entrance Examination only*."

Of the two proposals, I much prefer that of Sir W. Muir. I long ago supported the very similar suggestion made originally by Mr. H. S. Reid, that, after the F. A. Examination, the area of subject should be contracted, and students be allowed to take their B. A. degree either in languages, the English with one Oriental; or in History and Philosophy; or in Mathematics and the Natural Sciences. Sir W. Muir's scheme goes further, and gives more thorough encouragement to the single study of Oriental languages. And if there were no alternative but this to Mr. Bayley's recommendation I should certainly take it. But I am inclined to think that we may reach the end we have in view without interfering with the arrangements of the Calcutta University, whose special object it is, and I think should be, to stimulate an English education.

The Lahore University College, recently founded, aims precisely at giving that encouragement to Oriental studies which has not been in the programme of the Calcutta University. To it I would have those students look who, either of their own inclination, or because of the race to which they belong, may think it preferable to win distinction in the field of Oriental Literature. It is quite feasible that they should pass the F. A. Examination of the Calcutta University, and, still remaining at our Colleges, seek the honors to be gained at Lahore,—honors all the more honorable that they will be awarded by a body existing for this special purpose.

Mr. Bayley's proposal seems to me insufficient. So long as other subjects are taken up with the Oriental language, although higher marks may be assigned to it than to any single branch of study, the candidate will, I believe, still give his utmost efforts to those other subjects, from a fear that failure in them may render of no avail proficiency in his own special classic.

Mr. Bayley lays some stress upon "a free encouragement of the critical study of the [Oriental] classical languages, "as being an accompaniment of a general advance in vernacular education." I do not myself see that the one thing necessarily goes with the other, nor would Mr. Bayley, I think, tell us that the thirty years during which the Bengali has been enriching itself "so largely from the Sanscrit sources" have been productive of that result which he argues for the future. So far as I can judge, the class of men who will devote themselves to Oriental Literature are not likely to take any active part in the promotion of education through the vernaculars. They will generally be prompted to their study either by a scholarly love of literary pursuits, and an admiration for Sanscrit or Arabic on account of their beauty as languages, or by a desire, half-national, half-pious, to make themselves familiar with those works in which lie buried the teachings of their forefathers on law, religion, ethics, philosophy. The education of such men will have owed little to the vernaculars; their lines of thought will be far away from the civilization of the west; and they will be more likely to despise, than to sympathize with, those who seek for practical information through a medium (to them) little less than barbarous. They may, no doubt, be the unconscious agents of strengthening and refining the vernaculars. But improvement of this kind will, it seems to me, touch popular education but very lightly. Something much more direct and intense will be needed to provide a proper store of language,—a scientific nomenclature, such as scholastic treatises will call for. But, while believing that we cannot look to the study of Oriental languages to help us much in this matter, I am equally sceptical as to the results expected from the University examinations being held in the vernaculars, and as to the propriety of putting the University to such a use.

Sir W. Muir, though admitting that for many years to come it will not be possible to go beyond the Entrance Examination, appears to hope that ultimately this path will be

open to all those distinctions to which English alone gives access now.

Mr. Bayley is less sanguine. He remarks (p. 23):—"While, therefore, I think that a long period of time, so long that it will be useless to speculate about anything beyond it, English must be an indispensable constituent of all higher education in India."

And again (p. 19):—"The desire for information and education once encouraged will satisfy itself, I have no doubt, where alone it can be fully satisfied at all, in the study of English literature and of English science."

The mechanical difficulties in our way seem to me so enormous as almost in themselves to justify Mr. Bayley's views. We have not only to frame a vocabulary of vast range, and then to translate into the vernacular, thus enriched, works of the utmost depth and subtlety; but we have to find men capable of lecturing on the subjects of examination when clothed in the dress of translation. It requires, I think, some stretch of the imagination to picture to one-self such a book as Hamilton's *Metaphysics* being expounded by a native who, to perform his task, will need both a very accurate knowledge of the language of the translation, and such a grasp of English as will enable him to study the work in the original. But, supposing all mechanical difficulty removed, so far as instruction and examination are concerned, we shall, it seems to me, be offering an education which will prove exceedingly unsatisfactory to those who avail themselves of it. For if we are to give them credit for loving learning for learning's sake, we shall have done little more than bring them in sight of the promised land which they are never to enter. It is impossible that translation should keep pace with the advance of European thought in any single direction. Those, therefore, who have gone far enough forward to wish to go further, will, by force of circumstances, come to a stand-still.

While, then, I admit that the standard of instruction in the vernaculars can be and must be raised, I do not believe that they will ever serve as a medium for a really liberal education.

I will state briefly why it is that I object to seeing the University system modified in the manner proposed.

Success in a University Examination is valued chiefly, if not entirely, because it gives admission to highly-paid appointments, which are open to those only whose knowledge of English is thus guaranteed. If, then, it is determined to encourage vernacular education, and to employ the University to that end, it will be necessary that the Government should give material support by largely increasing the number of posts to which an education of this kind will be a pass-port. But what will be the effect upon the University? I believe that we shall have struck an almost fatal blow at English, and have revolutionized the whole system of education as at present existing. When once it is felt that the prizes given to vernacular education are as well worth winning as those which reward an equal knowledge of English, our students of that language will rapidly decrease in number, and in a few years we shall reckon by tens, where we now reckon by hundreds. Of course the time will come when the market will be glutted with the vernacular supply, and the field of English will again come under cultivation to a certain extent. But, meanwhile, the damage done will be such as is not easily or quickly to be repaired. For, great as have been the efforts needed to call forth and keep alive the desire after a liberal education in English, they are as nothing compared to those which we shall be forced to make if, having once desisted, we wish to resume our work.

But if no material encouragement is held out, I do not see to what class we are appealing. I am certain that the number of students in our High Schools and Colleges who, having begun to learn English, would desire to enter the University by means of the vernacular, would be very small indeed. And there would be fewer still who, having matriculated in English, would, in the higher examinations, wish to return to the vernacular. The boys of our Tehseelee schools might to some extent take advantage of the opening, and matriculate,

at the University for the sake of its certificate. But, so far as my experience goes, there would be scarcely any who would desire to go further. They are, as a rule, too poor to spend over their education years during which they might be earning a fairly comfortable livelihood. The circumstances by which they are surrounded are not such as to make much learning very profitable to them. They live in the country among agriculturists, themselves destined to guide the plough, or to take to trade in some small way. There is little of that struggle for existence which goes on in large towns; and they are well enough aware that even if they could bring themselves to leave their villages for a wider sphere, they would have but small chance with those who, from their earliest youth, have enjoyed greater advantages.

I cannot, therefore, believe that from such a quarter we should see many competitors, though the University opened its doors to welcome them in the manner proposed. And to gain nothing more than this, it does not seem to me that we should be right in altering the constitution of the University.

The evil which we would remove is a local one, and may, I think, be dealt with locally. There would be nothing to prevent the Government of a particular part of the country from raising the standard of vernacular education there prevailing. It might insist upon a certificate of some kind or other from every applicant for a vernacular appointment; and hold yearly examinations for the award of these certificates. This measure would very quickly make itself felt in every school. It might, further, assist such Societies as that at Allygurh, not only by rewards for special works, but by introducing approved translations into all purely Government Schools, and by recommending their adoption in those partly supported by grants-in-aid. Many other ways would suggest themselves, or be suggested from outside, so soon as it was understood that the Government had recognised the importance of the question, and was prepared to reward those who helped it in its endeavours. Hitherto, though we have been

trying to extend vernacular education, we have been more anxious about the quantity than the quality; and have, in regard to Oordoo, thrown cold water upon its improvement, and alienated those who might have aided us by giving so little encouragement to the study of Persian.

I have not the least doubt that if we show ourselves in earnest we shall in a few years see in the vernaculars all that is necessary for a sound school education, while to those who aim at something higher, a knowledge of English will ever be indispensable.

AGRA :

(Sd.) K. DEIGHTON,

14th April, 1870.

Principal, Agra College.

MEMORANDUM No. 2.—By J. SIME, Esq., *Professor, Agra College, Member of the Senate, Calcutta University.*

BEFORE proceeding to consider the special questions, I shall venture to offer a few general remarks.

And, first, I cannot think that the comparatively small success of the Calcutta University in the North-Western Provinces is, in any degree, owing to the unsuitableness of the present curriculum. I believe that, had the people of these provinces, with all their peculiarities, been the inhabitants since 1857 of Lower Bengal, the system of the Calcutta University would, by this time, have effected among them changes as great, and results as important, as it has produced among the Bengalees. It would be a wonder were it otherwise. The scheme of the Calcutta University is so unpointed catholic, it has been called, that it cannot but be suitable, in a general way, to any nation whatever. I am far from admitting that a change of curriculum would not be expedient, is not, indeed, all things considered, urgently required: what I am anxious to be understood to say is, that the small success of the Calcutta University in the North-Western Provinces, compared with the great results of that Institution in Bengal, is owing almost entirely to external and not to internal circumstances.

In the second place, it is granted that the special aim of the Calcutta University is the introduction into India of Western science and thought, and that a degree of acquaintance with English will long be necessary for that end. If it be also conceded, as I think it should be, that the study of the English language is not only useful as an instrument, but for its own sake, then I shall make two assertions: (1), that it will never be possible, without detriment to the highest aim of the University, to decrease its science standards; and (2), that a great evil would be done to learning in this country were English for generations to come to cease to be of highest account. The first statement carries with it its own support; the second is weaker. But, if it be considered how much the character of a people appears in their language, and that, apart from its intellectual and moral force, there is something wholesomely practical and not fanciful in the genius of a Western phrase, then perhaps it may also be thought that it is not simply by the importation of learned ideas that the Calcutta University is to do her highest duty to India, but by the imparting and enforcing of these clothed in an English garb. As a matter of fact, it is even wonderful, the difference between a lad educated in the Vernacular and another who has attained to a similar standard in English.

It should also be observed (and any want of discrimination here will vitally affect the whole case) that, in addition to the question concerning the constitution of the Senate of the University, and the mode of conducting its proceedings, two other matters, perfectly distinct, and not one only, are suggested by the papers under consideration. That is to say, the issue about the vernacular languages is by no means identical with that respecting the Oriental Classics. By the former it is proposed to give to the vernaculars an entirely new place, substituting them for English, the present staple language of the University; by the latter, the relative place of the classics is to remain the same, a higher standard only being required. It is quite true that Mr. Bayley, in his

proposal regarding the Entrance Examination, leaves English optional with one or other of the vernacular languages, but it is this very alternative—an alternative permitting a change in the staple language—which renders the distinction to which I have referred imperative. There is, however, very much more involved in leaving English optional in any examination than the mere matter of giving encouragement to vernacular education.

Having premised thus much, I shall now proceed to remark on the special points. According to their complexity, they are :—(1). The constitution of the University Senate relative to the North-Western Provinces ; (2), the question regarding a higher place to the oriental classical languages ; and (3), that respecting the place of the vernaculars.

Under the first head, His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor proposes, first, the constitution of a Branch Senate at Allahabad, with power to examine and recommend for degrees. Now, there is no doubt but that, as remarked by Mr. Bayley, the delegation of such powers to a purely local body would, by disjoining the action, tend to impair the efficiency of the University, and might produce even worse results ; yet it appears to me that His Honor's proposal, tantamount it may be to what would constitute a new University, touches on the points absolutely required for the success of higher education in Upper India. The want of a peculiar curriculum, I have asserted, is not sufficient to account for the comparatively small influence of the Calcutta University in these parts. I venture now to say that that want of influence is owing, almost entirely, to the great distance of the locality of this Government from the University seat. To be influential, a system of education must be a living, moving thing,—going down, as a power, to the people. Now, I am far from saying that there is not much of that in the education which is being carried on in these Provinces, stirring and elevating those who are reached ; but I will be bold to say that the Calcutta University is not such a power. The people

have to come up to it. Consequently, (for the well-to-do classes in this country have not shewn themselves to be the first to go out to a University) the undergraduates of our Colleges are mostly the sons of poor parents, and therefore not the best material for effective use. So it will continue, I believe, until, somehow or other, the four or five millions upon whom a University in these provinces might work are stirred up directly by some living and distinctly local influence.

His Honor also proposes an Annual Convocation at Allahabad for conferring degrees. This, by bringing the Calcutta University, in a public manner, home to the North-Western Provinces, would do good. The natives of this country are peculiarly susceptible to influence in such a way; and there seems to be no reason why they should not receive the healthy stimulus from such an influence. Should any obstacle arise on account of the Vice-Chancellor's inability to attend the Convocation in person, it will, I presume, be always in his power to appoint a substitute, say a Provincial Fellow, to act for him.

The desire of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor to have a Syndicate at Allahabad may be all but met by a monthly meeting of the Fellows there resident, who, though they should have, in the eyes of the University, no executive powers, might still be able to suggest measures of great value to the higher education of these provinces.

But the special proposal under this head is that of Mr. Bayley. He recommends to the Syndicate that non-resident Fellows should be allowed to express their opinions, and to vote by proxy on all matters which may come before the Faculties or the Senate. The result of this proposal would be, provided always the North-Western Provinces were sufficiently represented in the Senate, to make it impossible that the wants of Upper India should not, in the councils of the University, receive all the consideration that could be wished. Should such a rule be passed, the Calcutta University will then, I believe, have done the utmost it can towards its outlying provinces.

It will not even then, to my thinking, ensure all the results which might be expected from a University ; but it will put an end to questions which are merely of formal value, and eventually prove, all other things having been granted, that even a University must lose its power *much* when nearly a thousand miles away.

Mr. Bayley fears that the time required for the working of his scheme might, in cases, act prejudicially. Is it, however, absolutely necessary to circulate the subjects submitted for discussion so long as six weeks before the meeting at which they are to be considered ? I am not aware of ever having received anything like such notice when resident in Calcutta ; and all that non-resident members require in addition is but a few days in lieu of the time taken in transit. The provision for a second meeting, if required, is no doubt met by the power of a majority to adjourn any business at any meeting.

The second point is with regard to the place of the Eastern classics. Relative to this, it is proposed to allow students to go up in Honors in the Oriental classical languages without the pre-requisite of a B. A. degree. The proposal is His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor's. His aim is the encouragement of vernacular literature. Now, there is no doubt but that, in addition to the training they afford, many considerations make the Eastern classics of great importance in an Indian University,—their value, for example, as national heritages, and as religious, philological, scientific and antiquarian relics ; and it can as little be doubted that, as these languages become known, not only will the vernaculars be enriched, but a better vernacular literature will be the result : why, however, these classics should be allowed to take the place of Western learning is far from being so clear. We grant that there is much need of encouragement towards the more familiar acquaintance with the Oriental classics ; and we might be able to say that, by all means, this encouragement should be given in the way His Honor proposes ;

but why give up Western science? Can that harmlessly be done? Besides, it should be carefully observed that the B. A. degree scarcely brings a student to the gates of science. It may be true that after passing the First Arts Examination an undergraduate may know enough of English to make him a tolerable translator from that language; but if, as I believe, a system of translated books can never be but the first stage of a literature, if it must require an imbibing of thoughts into the spirit before there can be anything like a basis for vernacular writings worthy of the name, then the necessity for retaining, and rather raising than impairing, the B. A. standard in Western science will be seen. Thus, I demur to giving up the B. A. degree. With His Honor I feel strongly that something is urgently required to encourage the Eastern classical languages, and so to re-act upon the vernaculars; but I should fear that any neglect of Western science and Western thought would have a dangerous counter-effect. On this, I may have something to propose hereafter.

The third and last matter is about giving encouragement to the study of the vernacular languages. To a great extent these are neglected by the Calcutta University—a fact all the more lamentable, ‘because the great need of the people at present is a vernacular literature.’ A remedy is suggested by Mr. Bayley in the proposal, ‘that the Entrance Examination be held *optionally* in the vernacular, and optionally also the languages taken up should be English, one vernacular and one Oriental classical language, or one vernacular and a higher standard of attainments in either Sanskrit or Arabic. The peculiarity of this recommendation is the encouragement of the vernacular languages at the expense of English. In its last phase English is deposed altogether. Now, doubtless, this proposal would accomplish, in a manner, its end—the encouragement of vernacular learning, though not of vernacular literature—and it would besides be in harmony with the spirit of that

view which sees a time, not very distant, when, for University training in India, the vernaculars will be all in all. Not only, however, am I not able to see that time, but in keeping with a keen cultivation of the Oriental classics, and a sound knowledge of the vernaculars, I can see English still retaining its place—the language not of the masses, but of the upper schools and colleges—if it be true, as I believe it to be, that we are now seeing in this country the small beginnings of what will grow into a great literature. Should English, indeed, be excluded from the Universities a moment before India has become saturated with Western ideas, and has caught the fire of Western intelligence,—a state of matters not likely to be brought about for long years to come,—I venture to predict that, with that exclusion, there will come the stoppage albeit the paralysis and termination of further progress.

But particularly Mr. Bayley's proposal will tell only on a very few—those, namely, who in course of time may be expected to come up to the University from the lower schools. None in the cities, I presume, nor in the zillah schools, will prefer a vernacular language to English. None, at any rate, would do so now. Moreover, the Entrance Examination will be the limit to which, meanwhile, these students will be able to aspire; while, further, for want of a knowledge of English, the end so much to be desired, namely, the encouragement of a vernacular literature, will not be attained. That, therefore, must be sought for in another way—noither disparaging English on the one hand nor science on the other.

I therefore conclude by proposing the following skeleton of a scheme which may not be considered amiss. But, first, two things appear to me to be clear: that the studies of the present curriculum, unchanged, will not admit of a higher Oriental standard; and that, if anything is to be taken from the present readings, that might best be done from the course of English literature. It will be observed, by way

of explanation, that much of the present English studies consists in the rhetorical and grammatical criticism of passages, the tracing of allusions and etymologies, and so forth. Now, such studies are of great importance, and far be it from me to imply anything to the contrary; but that the heaviest part of the student's work should result merely in an acquaintance with Bacon's peculiar works, Chaucer's peculiar forms, and some of the sentiments of Shakespeare, cannot be enough. What is desired most is the power of using English as an instrument of thought, or conversely, of receiving thought from it. I would, therefore, suggest that the Entrance Examination should demand the ability to write an English paragraph with tolerable accuracy; and that the critical readings of English texts should cease with the First Arts Course. The First Arts Examination might have two papers in English—one on a prescribed text, say a play of Shakespeare, the other, keeping what is practically important paramount, requiring the writing of an English Essay, and some translations from English into the vernacular. Thus, I am sure, a better acquaintance with English than at present would be attained, and a considerable amount of time, which might be devoted to Oriental learning, would be over. English will still remain the instrument of education, and may be further studied as an Honor subject; the sciences, too, will retain their place, and a higher standard of classical and vernacular learning will be the result. Should there be good teachers of English in the schools, and were it possible to have European scholars to guide the higher Oriental learning in the Colleges, such a scheme as the above, I conceive, would have few other obstacles.

(Sd.) J. SIME,

AGRA: } Professor of Eng. Literature, Agra
The 15th April, 1870. } College, and Member of the Senate,
 Calcutta University.

MEMORANDUM No. 3.—*By H. S. REID, Esq., Member,
Board of Revenue, and Member of the Senate, Calcutta
University.*

MR. BAYLEY takes up three points, mooted in the first instance by the Lieutenant-Governor.

1st.—Appointment of a Branch Syndicate of the Calcutta University at Allahabad (as the Vice-Chancellor interprets Sir William Muir's proposal) for the purposes of consultation, and advising the Senate on all matters regarding the North-Western Provinces, and also for the virtual conduct of examinations.

2nd.—A Branch Convocation at Allahabad.

3rd.—Greater encouragement of the study of Oriental Literature, and larger employment of the Vernacular as the medium of teaching.

2. Mr. Bayley objects to the first proposal on the ground that “to give a purely local body any degree of authority, specially with reference to local matters, would impair very materially the uniformity of action which is absolutely essential to the success of an University, and which would give, moreover, room for very great diversity of opinion, and to grave risks of dissension.”

3. Mr. Bayley (it appears to me) assumes that His Honor asks for an independent executive University government for the North-Western Provinces. I do not understand that His Honor asks for anything of the kind. I understand, rather, that Sir William Muir would have the Governor-General in Council, under Section 6 of the University Act, appoint more Fellows for the North-Western Provinces, who should be delegated by the Senate to meet at Allahabad for the purposes of consultation and of advising the Senate (or the Syndicate) in all matters relating specially to the North-Western Provinces.

4. A Syndicate is not an advising, but an executive body, with functions very different (I take it) from those which His

Honor would assign to the North-Western Provinces' Fellows.

5. I do not quite follow the Vice-Chancellor when he talks of the "purely local body," &c., hardly because the North-Western Provinces' Fellows would belong, as a rule, to the North-Western Provinces; for, with the exception of the Lieutenant-Governor of the time, and myself, and perhaps one Inspector of Schools in Bengal, the original Fellows of the Calcutta University were not only for the most part attached to Bengal, but, with the exceptions above-named, were either resident in, or had their head-quarters at, Calcutta; and yet the Senate could hardly have been called a "purely local body."

6. I would ask His Honor's attention to the following modification of what I understand to be his plan. The Senate of the Calcutta University consists of—

(1.) Chancellor.

(2.) Vice-Chancellor.

(3.) Fellows *Ex-officio* (or appointed by the Governor-General in Council), constituting the Senate. (The Calcutta University Calendar for 1869-70 returns 95 Fellows, of whom three only, I believe, belong to these Provinces.) The Senate is divided into 4 Faculties (Arts, Law, Engineering, Medicine). The Syndicate is composed of the Vice-Chancellor (the President) and 6 Fellows, 3 of whom are elected by the Faculty of Arts, and the rest by the other Faculties. I would propose the appointment to the Syndicate of two additional Members, to be elected by the Faculty of Arts from among the North-Western Provinces' Fellows, if possible, resident at Allahabad.

7. I omit from my proposal the election of North-Western Provinces' representative Members of the Syndicate by the Faculties of Law, &c. In regard to the special and technical subjects of Law, Engineering, and Medicine, what serves for Bengal will serve equally well for the North-Western

Provinces. It is otherwise with the larger and more important subject Arts, which includes Languages (as Classics), Mathematics (pure and mixed), History and Geography, Mental and Moral Philosophy, and Natural and Physical Science.

8. All matters connected with the educational requirements of these Provinces would be laid before the Syndicate by the North-Western Provinces' Members, to whom copies of all proceedings of the Calcutta Members, excepting those of a merely formal nature, should be furnished.

9. The plan sketched out above would maintain the uniformity of action Mr. Bayley properly insists on. If it is rejected and none other is devised, we must accept the more cumbrous plan suggested by Mr. Bayley in pp. 10 *et. seq.* of his Minute, even though it would entail great and frequent delays, with the Members of the Faculty (*e. g.*, that of Arts, with its 60 Members) scattered all over Upper India and Lower Bengal. But the plan would be an improvement on the present system, under which non-resident Members of a Faculty are seldom (I might, speaking from personal experience, even say never) consulted.

10. The Vice-Chancellor apprehends (apparently) no difficulty in carrying out His Honor's proposal for holding yearly Convocations at Allahabad for the conferment of degrees granted by the Senate. That the holding of such Convocations would be beneficial and advantageous in many ways has been clearly shown in His Honor's letter (quoted in pp. 3 and 4 of Mr. Bayley's Minute).

11. On the last of the subjects, *viz.*, "greater encouragement of the study of Oriental Literature, and larger employment of the vernacular as the medium of teaching," I can add very little to what I recorded in my Memorandum of the 19th October, 1868. I then wrote that "the better encouragement of all classes and denominations of Her Majesty's subjects in the pursuit of a regular and liberal course of

education" (the object for which the Calcutta University was established—see preamble of Act II. of 1857) might be effected if English were treated more as a *classic* and the vernacular adopted as the medium of instruction and examination, due regard being paid, at the same time, to the thorough and scholarly study of the learned Oriental languages.

12. In the same Memorandum I proposed that the student who had passed the First Examination in Arts, and had thus given sufficient proof of his ability to read any English author of ordinary difficulty, should be allowed to go up for honors in Arabic or Sanskrit to secure a B. A. degree, in place of taking up the present prescribed course of English Literature. History, Mathematics, &c., might be taken up by such student in the vernacular.

13. The Vice-Chancellor proposes that, for the present at least, the Examinations for Entrance only should be *conducted* in the vernacular. "I would not," he writes, "relax the rule which requires a Bachelor's degree as a condition of taking honors in the Oriental languages. It will, I think, be sufficient encouragement to give in all the Examinations a somewhat higher value to the marks in these languages, and to permit them to be substituted for English in the Entrance Examination only. * * * *"

I would propose that the Entrance Examination be held optionally in the vernacular, and optionally also the language to be taken up should be English, one vernacular, and one Oriental language, as at present; or one vernacular and a higher standard of attainments in either Sanskrit or Arabic."

14. Before proceeding to examine this proposal, I would observe that, under *existing* rules the languages to be taken up at the Entrance Examination are not "English and one vernacular and one Oriental language," but English and one other language, which may either be a vernacular or a learned Oriental language (Arabic or Sanskrit), or Greek or Hebrew, &c.

15. Mr. Bayley would not compel the candidate for entrance into the University to pass any examination whatever in English, but at the same time he would not relax the English Literature tests at the F. A. and B. A. Examinations. I am unable to see how this change would benefit the student, or promote the study of the Oriental languages. Virtually you say to the student—"To encourage you to pursue Oriental studies, we excuse your passing a comparatively easy English examination in 1870, on the condition that two years after you shall go up to a much stiffer examination in that language." That is, you commence by removing the inducement to acquire a knowledge of English, and end by insisting that no student shall be allowed to go up for honors in the learned Oriental languages if he does not pass previously a very severe examination in English Literature.

16. The Vice-Chancellor believes that some such scheme as his has been recommended by each of the present Directors of Public Instruction in the North-Western Provinces, the Punjab and Oudh. My impression is that those gentlemen would deprecate very strongly the exclusion of English from the list of subjects for the Entrance Examination, and that the proposals which have been made for the amendment of the present *curriculum* have for their object the substitution of the vernacular for English as the medium of instruction and examination, and not the lowering of the standard of English scholarship.

17. Our Anglo-Vernacular Colleges should turn out scholars possessed of a sound classical knowledge of English, a thorough acquaintance with the Grammar and idioms of their own vernacular, a sound classical knowledge of the Oriental language cognate to their vernacular, and, lastly, that amount of general information and scientific knowledge which every man who has received a *liberal* education is expected to possess.

18. To attain this end, we must teach English and the learned Oriental languages as *classics*; the student must be

frequently exercised in English, Arabic, or Sanskrit and vernacular composition, and in translation from one language into another (of those above-named); the vernacular, in which his thinking and reasoning processes are carried on, must be the medium through which scientific knowledge and general information will be acquired.

19. The Vice-Chancellor believes that "the Lieutenant-Governor is quite ready to raise the standard of teaching in the vernacular as rapidly as can be done up to the standard of the Entrance Examination." This has been done, I may say, long ago, perhaps some eighteen years ago, in the case of the most advanced Tehseelee Schools.

20. To sum up, I would suggest the following modification of the existing regulations regarding the subjects for examination :—

ENTRANCE EXAMINATION.

1. English.
2. Arabic or Sanskrit (Grammar and easy "Reader").
3. Vernacular (Urdu or Hindee) Grammar and Selections.
4. History, Geography, and Mathematics, as at present, but conduct of examination in vernacular optional with the student.

FIRST EXAMINATION IN ARTS.

1. English.
2. Arabic or Sanskrit.
3. History and other subjects as at present, &c. (see 4 above).

B. A. EXAMINATION.

As at present. But in the case of students going up for honors in Arabic or Sanskrit, the Examination in English Literature to be dispensed with, and that in History, Mathematics, Moral and Mental Philosophy, and Natural and

Physical Science to be conducted in the student's vernacular language.

(Sd.) H. S. REID,

ALLAHABAD :	}	Member, Board of Revenue,
The 16th April, 1870.		and Member of the Senate, Calcutta University.

MEMORANDUM No. 4.—By HON'BLE C. A. TURNER,
Officiating Chief Justice, High Court, N-W. P.

INASMUCH as I do not profess to have a thorough acquaintance with the state of education in these Provinces, I venture to express an opinion on the Minute of the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Calcutta with great diffidence.

His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor, North-Western Provinces, in the communication he addressed to the Syndicate of the Calcutta University, aimed at four principal objects :—

1. In view of the spécial circumstances and requirements of these provinces, the securing to the provinces a fair and effective representation in the Councils of the University.
2. The establishment of a Syndicate for the purpose of holding examinations at Allahabad.
3. The holding of Convocations at Allahabad for the purpose of conferring degrees.
4. The lowering of the standard of English required by the University of Calcutta of all candidates for the degree of B. A., in the case of students who may present themselves for examination in honors in an Oriental language.

I propose to address myself to the first and fourth of His Honor's proposals only, inasmuch as I apprehend from the Vice-Chancellor's Minute that he is prepared to support changes in the University arrangements which would effect the objects contemplated by the second and third proposals.

I confess that the first proposal of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor appears to me far better calculated to secure the end His Honor had in view than the arrangement which the Vice-Chancellor would substitute for it.

If I understand His Honor's proposal rightly, it does not necessitate the conferment on the local body of any authority which should bind the University *absolutely*. The power would be left to the Senate of rejecting any scheme suggested by the local body. His Honor simply proposes that the members of the Senate who might compose the Branch Syndicate at Allahabad should, after consultation and conference with one another, submit a matured scheme for the consideration of the Senate whenever it might appear to them that the circumstances of these provinces required an alteration in the University curriculum. By this proposal, two advantages would be secured, which are wanting in the scheme proposed by the Vice-Chancellor. In the first place, the Senate of the University would not be troubled with the consideration of a number of crude propositions put forward by individual members of the Senate residing in the North-Western Provinces. All such propositions would, before submission to the Senate, have been fully discussed and sifted in the Syndicate at Allahabad ; and, in the second place, very much greater weight would be claimable for a proposition which had received the assent of the majority of the Branch Syndicate than could be claimed for a proposition emanating from a single member of the Senate, however eminent.

Nor do I understand in what manner His Honor's proposal would " materially impair the uniformity of action which is absolutely essential to the success of the University." As I have before noticed, His Honor does not propose that the proposals of the Branch Syndicate should possess any *absolute* authority. They would, and it appears to me that they ought to, have great weight in influencing the resolutions of the Senate, but they would not be imperatively binding on the Senate. Unless accepted by the Senate, they would effect no

change in the uniformity of the University system. At the same time, I think it may be fairly questioned whether absolute uniformity is essential to the success of the University. If by absolute uniformity the benefits which might otherwise result from the University are contracted, then uniformity, so far from being essential, is in fact injurious to the success of the University. The circumstances of the Upper and Lower Provinces vary to such a degree, that an University system which would suit the one might be unsuited to the other; and, unless this diversity of circumstances is recognized, I am doubtful whether the University of Calcutta will ever fully meet the requirements of the North-Western Provinces.

To proceed to the fourth of His Honor's proposals, the lowering of the standard in English required of candidates for a B. A. degree who may present themselves for examination in honors in an Oriental language.

That a very large number of persons in these provinces, and chiefly Mahomedans, are averse to the study of English, although not averse to the study of Oriental languages, nor even to the study of special sciences, when they can find treatises composed in an Oriental language, my brief residence in this country has sufficed to impress on me. To adduce an instance which is the subject of my daily observation. With one single exception, all the most distinguished Hindoo Pleaders, who practice or have practiced since its institution in our High Court, possess a fair knowledge of, and plead in, the English language. The Mahomedan Pleaders, with scarcely an exception, are unacquainted with the English language, or at least do not plead in it, nor profess to understand more than a few words in it, although it would be manifestly for their advantage to do so. Yet many of these Mahomedan Pleaders are men of great acumen and learning; some of them being able to quote not only from treatises on their law published in India, but from treatises published in Arabic in other countries. It is at the same time gratifying to me to be in a position to add that I believe that the

objection to the study of the English language even among very strict Mahomedans is gradually dying out. I have met Mahomedan gentlemen of good family who are having their sons carefully educated in English, and it cannot be doubted that the advantages which a knowledge of that language confers on its possessor, in respect of professional and other advancement, will eventually operate to eradicate what is rather a national prejudice than a prejudice of creed.

But although, as I have said, this prejudice is gradually dying out, its extinction must be the work of years; and so far from being accelerated, I fear it will be retarded by the exclusion of Mahomedans who do not possess a thorough knowledge of English from University degrees, and the advantages which are derived from such degrees.

There exists among Mahomedans in these provinces a great jealousy of Hindoos. They allege that an unfair proportion of appointments in the public service are conferred on Hindoos; and it may be conceived that, when they find themselves excluded from the advantages consequential on an University degree, they are led to conclude that the impediment is directly designed to deprive them of those advantages.

The proposal made by His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor, that a certain proficiency in English should be made the condition of University training and University distinction, and that candidates who have passed the Middle Examination should not be required to undergo a further examination in English, approves itself to my mind more than the proposal of the Vice-Chancellor to allow an Oriental language to be substituted for English in the Entrance Examination only. It would, I think, be found that many Mahomedan students would be ready to study the English language, to qualify themselves to attain the lower standard required in the Entrance and Middle Examination, if they were permitted to substitute an Oriental language for English in the final examination for degree. This alteration would be somewhat

similar to that which I believe to have been effected in the curriculum of the University of Oxford since I left the University. During my residence in Oxford it was required of every candidate for honors at the final examination in Law and History, Mathematics and Natural Science, that he should pass the final examination in the school of *Literæ humaniores*. But it was found that many students who could have gained high honors in the former schools were unable, by reason of their defective knowledge of Latin and Greek, to pass the final examination in the latter school; and I believe I am right in saying that a statute was passed exempting students who might obtain honors in the Schools of Law, Mathematics or Natural Science from the necessity of passing the final examination in the school of *Literæ humaniores* in order to obtain a degree. Of this I am certain, that the proposition was brought before the University, and was supported by some of the most eminent members of the tutorial body.

Were the concession which is sought by His Honor granted by the University, I feel assured that the result would be achieved, which is the common object of His Honor and of the Vice-Chancellor, namely, the extension of the study of the English language. Not only would many students who now abstain from its study be induced to devote themselves to it by the knowledge that the required standard was lowered, but inasmuch as English, unlike Greek and Latin, is a living language, they would, when they had once mastered the difficulty of obtaining a partial knowledge of it, be induced, by the obvious advantages which would result to them from a more perfect knowledge of it, to improve themselves in it after they had obtained their degrees, although they might not be willing during their period of their undergraduateship to devote so much time to it as would enable them to attain the high standard required for the B. A. degree.

(Sd.) C. A. TURNER,
Offg. Chief Justice.

27th April, 1870.

MEMORANDUM No. 5.—*By* A. O. HUME, ESQ., C. B.,
Commissioner, Inland Customs, and Member of the Senate,
Calcutta University.

GENERALLY, I may say that I concur in the views set forth in Sir William Muir's Minute. Referring to Mr. Bayley's review of this latter (p. 9), I confess my inability to understand why a Branch Syndicate should *not* be *avowedly* created at Allahabad, both "for the purposes of consultation and advising the Senate in all matters regarding the North-Western Provinces," and also for the actual (not merely *virtual*) conduct of examinations of students belonging to the North-Western Provinces. Mr. Bayley says that he "cannot think that the Lieutenant-Governor, in making this proposal, quite appreciated the present method of carrying on the business of the University." I apprehend, on the contrary, that it was the very fact of his thoroughly appreciating that method that led Sir William Muir to *make* the proposal. Wrongly or rightly, it is unquestionably the impression amongst many of those most interested in education in the Punjab and North-Western Provinces, that the ruling powers of the Calcutta University are not sufficiently cognizant with *extra*-Bengal educational requirements, and that they bear about the same relation to the Bengal Presidency, as a whole, that an English House of Parliament, whereof all the members should be elected in England, would to Great Britain and Ireland. Mr. Bayley goes on to say that "to give a purely local body any degree of authority, specially in reference to local matters, would very materially impair the uniformity of action which is absolutely essential to the success of the University;" but if we consider the matter fairly, what, as a matter of fact, is the working portion of the Calcutta University but a purely local body,—a local body, moreover, who possess authority not only in local matters, but throughout the whole Bengal Presidency. It is just *because* we feel that the interests of education suffer from the investiture of this one local body with practically absolute power to decide for

many other localities, of which their knowledge is necessarily more or less imperfect, that we wish to see other local bodies organized as counterpoises. No one doubts the integrity or ability of the resident working portion of the Calcutta University; but we do doubt that, as a rule, they are as well acquainted with the educational facts of the North-Western Provinces, the Punjab, &c., as they are with those of Bengal. We do feel that practically (though many of us may be Fellows) we are unrepresented, and we believe that some organized body is necessary to represent us in the Calcutta University with the weight which would attach to a regularly constituted Branch Syndicate at Allahabad.

It is by no means necessary or perhaps desirable that any *separate* authority, except in matters of mere detail, should be vested in the proposed branch; it would be sufficient that it should possess the power, as a body, of submitting from time to time recommendations and proposals which, as coming from a body representing the whole of the North-Western Provinces, would necessarily carry far more weight, be less liable to error, and far simpler to deal with, than separate Memos. by any number of individuals.

As for Mr. Bayley's plan of circulating proposals separately to all non-resident members of a Faculty, I utterly disagree. It would cause great delay, and, beyond a prodigious expenditure of stationery, nothing would come of it. What we want is an authorized place of meeting, accessible to us in the North-Western Provinces, where great questions can be freely discussed, and whence the views of the majority, and of any influential minority, can be authoritatively represented in the tersest and simplest form possible to the *Alma Mater*—at present, it is to be feared, a somewhat oblivious mother of all but her Bengalee children.

Referring to Mr. Bayley's dictum *in re* "the uniformity of action which is absolutely essential to the success of the University," I must remark, on the one hand, that this uniformity

may easily be pushed beyond the limits of usefulness ; and that, on the other, to prevent any rigidly uniform system of action being positively noxious, it is necessary that, in framing and recasting that system from time to time, the fullest consideration should be given to all local differences throughout the whole country which that system is to affect ; and this full consideration is, I submit, never so likely to be realized as when the wants and opinions of each province are represented by its own Branch Syndicate.

But what are the grave reasons that induce our Vice-Chancellor to repudiate so unhesitatingly these proposed branches ? He " feels assured that they would give room for very great diversity of opinion, and to grave risks of dissension ! " Talk of the infallibility of the Pope after this ! Would the prospects of education be so utterly compromised, then, if some of those interested in the cause did differ from the Vice-Chancellor of the Calcutta Syndicate ? What good thing ever yet was worked out without diversity of opinion ? Are we going "*alere flammam*" with the flint only, or is it by the clash of flint and steel that we look to strike out the sacred spark ?

The fact is that to make a Bengal Presidency University (invested with no traditional prestige) a living and developing success, it will not do merely to have a set of rules laid down by a local body (however eminent), and thereafter rigidly adhered to, even though by virtually retaining all power in the hands of that body, or their similarly circumstanced successors, difference of opinion may be silenced and dissensions suppressed. To be what it aims at, the system of the University must be a perpetually progressing and developing one, ever representing the matured opinions of the majority of the educated members of the vast community comprised within that presidency ; and how any approximation even to this is to be attained without the creation of local educational organizations, exercising a potential voice in the decision of important questions, such, for instance, as the proposed Branch

Syndicate might become, is more than even the Vice-Chancellor for himself, I think, can tell us.

The holding of Branch Convocations at Allahabad and Lahore follows as a matter of course, but I must note that I by no means see the necessity of the attendance of the present Vice-Chancellor; indeed, the best thing for education up-country would be to constitute the Lieutenant-Governors *ex-officio* Vice-Chancellors in their own provinces, and allow them to preside on these important occasions. There is no doubt that this would give far greater éclat, solemnity and emphasis to the Branch Convocation than even the attendance from Calcutta of the Vice-Chancellor, who, however distinguished for learning, respected and admired by Europeans, is nothing and nobody to ninety-nine out of every hundred of the students of the North-Western Provinces.

As regards the third question, I shall not attempt to discuss it in detail. I cordially agree that it is desirable that students who *have* passed the First Arts Examination should be allowed thereafter to go up for honors in Oriental languages, without passing as B. A.'s; but I am doubtful of the policy of allowing candidates for the Entrance Examination to be examined in the vernacular, or of allowing them at this examination to substitute for English one of the classical Oriental languages.

1st May, 1870.

(Sd.) A. O. HUME,

Comr., Inland Customs, and Member of
the Senate, Calcutta University.

MEMORANDUM No. 6.—By R. GRIFFITH, ESQ., *Principal, Benares College, and Member of the Senate, Calcutta University.*

I do not, I think, under-rate the importance, educationally, socially, and politically considered, of a careful study of the English language by natives of this country; it is, I am aware, at present the sole key, as far as an Indian is concerned, to

all that is worth knowing in History, Art, Science, and Philosophy. No legitimate and healthy means to promote the cultivation of English should, I think, be neglected, and the opportunities of acquiring a sound knowledge of it should be extended over as wide an area as possible. The University of Calcutta has had marvellous success in encouraging and stimulating this study in Bengal, and its influence in the same direction is not unfelt in the Provinces of Central and Upper India.

But for many years there must remain vast numbers of students whom circumstances keep hopelessly out of the reach of a sound English education. Many of these students may and do acquire a very fair elementary knowledge of Mathematics; they can read and understand any vernacular book that is placed before them; they can write grammatically, and even with some elegance, in their own language; they are tolerably well acquainted with Indian History, not altogether ignorant, perhaps, of the Histories of Greece, Rome, and England; and many have made considerable progress in Sanskrit, Arabic, or Persian. European students, with corresponding acquirements, would gain admission to any of the Universities of their respective countries. Even in Poland, I believe, candidates are not compelled to pass in Russian; and it seems to me that an Indian University, to be worthy of the name, should not exclude from the benefits of her examinations myriads of the natives of the country because they are unable to pass in a most difficult foreign language, which it is impossible for them to master without the assistance which it is impossible for them to obtain.

I am under little apprehension that the relaxation of the rule which now compels students to take up English for the University examinations would seriously diminish or discourage the study of English. English is studied in these provinces simply and solely for the substantial and tangible return it brings. A knowledge of English is valued not only because it enables its possessor to look down upon

his less educated fellow-men (among whom his own father generally holds the first place), but also because it frequently brings with it very considerable emoluments. The writership on Rs. 10, the Ticket Collectorship, the Deputy Inspectorship, the Mastership of the Zillah School, or a well paid post in a College—these are the prizes that one class of English students has in view. The tradesman's ambition is to dun Europeans in English; the independent gentleman's to increase his importance by talking English when he visits the *sahib log*, and boasting of the influence which this accomplishment gives him.

These incentives will not lose their force, and the study of English will not languish as long as it continues to pay.

I have based my advocacy of the proposed revolution in the University system, first, on the abstract principle of justice; and secondly, on the consideration that it will not injuriously affect the study of the English language and literature. The student who passes in English will still maintain an immense advantage over the student who passes in the vernacular; and the two classes will never be confounded in Indian eyes.

Independently of these considerations, I think there can be no doubt that the measure proposed will do for vernacular education almost what the present system has done for English. Although the number of candidates for the Entrance Examination will show at first no very startling increase, the new stimulus will be gradually and most beneficially felt. The classical languages will be more extensively and accurately studied, the vernacular will gain rapidly in copiousness, refinement, and strength, and the great and ever-increasing demand for text-books in Literature, History, and Science will produce a class of works which at present can scarcely be said to exist.

BENARES :
 May 3rd, 1870. } (Sd.) R. GRIFFITH,
 Principal, Benares College, and Member
 of the Senate, Calcutta University.

MEMORANDUM No. 7.—BY BABOO SIVA PRASAD, *Joint Inspector, 3rd Circle, Department Public Instruction, North-Western Provinces, and Member of the Senate, Calcutta University.*

THE first point noticed by His Honor is the fact that the North-Western Provinces are not represented in the Senate. To supply this want, His Honor has suggested the constitution of a branch of the Senate in these provinces. The Vice-Chancellor, being anxious not to “impair the uniformity of action,” instead of constituting a branch of the Senate, proposes to circulate every subject submitted to any Faculty for discussion to all the members of such Faculty, resident or non-resident, and to make it competent for members to vote by proxy.

If the constitution of a branch of the Senate in these provinces is not just now feasible, I think the proposal of the Vice-Chancellor may be given a fair trial for the present. It will be, no doubt, a great improvement on the existing system at any rate.

The second proposal of His Honor is to hold a Branch Convocation at Allahabad for the conferment of degrees. The Vice-Chancellor does not dispute it, and thinks that it may be carried out at a very small expenditure of money, and with very little inconvenience to the Registrar and Vice-Chancellor.

Now comes the third proposal of His Honor, with respect to which I fail to understand how it can be expected, in the form commended by the Vice-Chancellor to the favorable consideration of the Syndicate, to operate practically to the greater encouragement of English teaching. The two points considered by His Honor are :—

“1st.—Whether greater encouragement might be advantageously given to the study of Oriental literature; and, secondly, whether any part of the examinations might not be conducted in the vernacular.”

At the same time the Lieutenant-Governor “would not support any scheme which did not make proficiency in

English a condition of obtaining degrees." The Lieutenant-Governor goes further and says :—"It is only by the acquisition of English that the student can find his way to those stores of knowledge without which his fine writing is mere verbiage, for the most part worse than useless." The great object of His Honor is to have a Vernacular Literature; and for this end His Honor forces his students to pass the "Middle Examination" as it is, because "the knowledge of English Literature and Science necessary for the passing of that Examination" is supposed and acknowledged by His Honor to be the basis of all his future success. What His Honor suggests is simply, instead of compelling the student after the Middle Examination to prosecute his studies in English Literature and Science, to allow him to take up Oriental classics with a lower standard in English and in Science than the pre-requisite of a B. A. degree, for a University degree, which, to prevent confusion with the present B. A. degree, had, I may be allowed to suggest, better be called in a new name, such as Licentiate of Oriental Literature and Master of Oriental Classics. The proposal of the Lieutenant-Governor is most judicious and unexceptionable, in my humble opinion. If it may be made optional for the students in the Entrance Examination to answer the questions in Mathematics, History, and Geography for the present in vernacular, it will meet the want and gain the object in view.

But now let us see how the Vice-Chancellor has taken it up. He proposes that the examination for the Entrance "should be optionally conducted in the vernacular" only, and the Oriental languages should "be substituted for English." I am at a loss to discern how these vernacular-and-oriental-language undergraduates will be able to give any "marked stimulus" to the study of English, and "large extension of English education in the North-Western Provinces," as "confidently" expected by the Vice-Chancellor. No Oordoo-and-oriental-language undergraduate can possibly ever acquire a knowledge of English competent for Middle Examination or for "the attainment of honors and of the higher degree."

He must give up his studies further and seek some Mohur-rirship (Persian writership on low salary), or similar-appointment under the Government; and the idea of our Lieutenant-Governor to have students who "shall benefit the nation by raising its intellectual and moral standard, and conduce to its material and social advancement,"—"who availing themselves of the stores of European knowledge in a sufficient measure for the production of translation, compilation, or original works, containing valuable information drawn from those stores,"—who "would yet have access, through the English language, to the knowledge of History, Art, and Science,—and who being * * * imbued with the love of true learning, would be at the same time in the best position to communicate the fruits of their own studies in a native and attractive form to their fellow countrymen"—must remain dormant, or, I may say, a perfect delusion. His Honor pointed out a certain want and desideratum, and suggested means to supply it. The Vice-Chancellor, stating that he agrees to a certain extent, (but in my humble opinion disagreeing totally) seems to condemn the very principle on which the Lieutenant-Governor has based his proposal. The Vice-Chancellor enunciates a quite new principle and starts a quite new proposal, *viz.*, to fill the "gap" between high English education and elementary vernacular instruction by improved instruction in the vernacular, *i. e.*, by having vernacular undergraduates who may be followed in time by vernacular graduates: thus realizing the ideas of the Vernacular-University-wallahs. Without discussing the merits of the much-discussed question of the Vernacular University, I deplore the depreciation by the Vice-Chancellor of the most valuable proposal of our Lieutenant-Governor.

(Sd.) SIVA PRASAD,

Joint Insp., 3rd Circle, D. P. I., N.-W. P.,
and Member of the Senate, Calcutta University.

BENARES : }
The 3rd May, 1870. }

MEMORANDUM No. 8—*By* M. S. HOWELL, Esq.

It is admitted on all sides that the time has arrived for raising the standard of vernacular education in the North-Western Provinces, and there is also a general accord as to the means by which this end is to be secured. These are—(1st) to concede to those who are interested in the cause of education in these provinces more influence in the Councils of the Calcutta University, which directs and controls the general system of official instruction throughout this presidency; (2nd), to permit students to pass at their option some at least of the University examinations in the vernacular; and (3rd) to offer more encouragement to the study of the classical Oriental languages, Arabic and Sanskrit. But there is some divergence of opinion as to the manner in which these changes should be effected, and the degree to which they should be carried.

His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor proposed the appointment of additional Fellows for these Provinces, who should meet and consult at Allahabad, and whose functions should consist in advising the Senate on all matters affecting the North-Western Provinces, and in conducting the examination of students from these and adjoining Provinces, and reporting the results to the Senate, which would thereupon proceed to grant its degrees. He further recommended that these degrees should be conferred by a Branch Convocation at Allahabad. The Vice-Chancellor, conceding the point of the local convocation, objected to the "virtual conduct of examinations at Allahabad," and proposed an alternative scheme by which each Fellow resident out of Calcutta should be able to advocate and enforce his opinion on any question through a written Minute and a vote by proxy. The Lieutenant-Governor had merely suggested that the Fellows should consult together and advise the Senate on local matters, and there is nothing in the Vice-Chancellor's scheme to prevent the Fellows from consulting at Allahabad or elsewhere, and submitting their views in a collective note, with

separate Minutes, if necessary, from dissentient members, and each Fellow could then support his opinion by his vote. The only substantial disagreement is upon the desirability of vesting in the local Fellows the conduct of the examinations and the decision upon the results. For if the Senate at Calcutta is to grant degrees upon the report of the Fellows at Allahabad, it is clear that the latter body will virtually have in its own hands the power of granting and withholding degrees. I believe, however, that, under the present system, the University examinations for students in these Provinces are held at the several local affiliated institutions through the medium of papers set by examiners who are appointed by the University, and that the success or failure of the candidates depends upon the accord of these examiners. The Lieutenant-Governor's proposal does not express in detail the part to be taken by the Fellows at Allahabad in the conduct of the examinations; but if it contemplates the appointment of separate examiners for the North-Western Provinces by the local Fellows, or if it intends that the Fellows or some of their number shall themselves be the examiners, its result would be to introduce a system of examination in these provinces separate and different from that prevailing elsewhere. The University as an examining body would in fact be at Allahabad, and the institution at Calcutta would merely confer the honors accorded by the local branch. It is probable that similar arrangements would eventually be made for other main divisions of the presidency, and thus we should virtually have a federation of Universities, the general harmony of whose action would be maintained through the control of the collective body of Fellows, and whose ultimate disintegration into separate local Universities could be readily effected wherever the requirements of the day should render such a step expedient. The Vice-Chancellor's observations at page 10 of his Minute seem to show that these results are anticipated by the present governing body of the University at Calcutta, and that the Lieutenant-Governor's proposals will meet with

opposition on this head. The students of that University and its affiliated institutions form, however, a composite heterogeneous mass, originally separated by the accident of birth into great divisions, speaking different vernacular languages, cherishing distinct local associations, and, except in Bengal Proper, feeling no attraction whatever to Calcutta. As their numbers increase their diversities of race, language, manners, customs, habits and modes of thought will inevitably produce a desire to localise their educational institutions; and some such measure of decentralisation as that now proposed by His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor will have to be conceded to postpone the eventual alternative of disruption and segregation. The scheme, then, for the creation of a Branch Syndicate at Allahabad seems an opportune advance in the direction which must ultimately be followed, as the adoption of this or some analogous measure is merely a question of time.

As regards the 2nd and 3rd of the means proposed for raising the standard of vernacular education, the Vice-Chancellor would permit the Entrance Examination to be conducted in the vernacular, and would allow a candidate at that Examination to substitute a higher degree of attainments in Arabic or Sanskrit for the English test, which is now obligatory. This measure would carry education in the vernacular as far as the Entrance Examination, and create a class of students more proficient in Arabic or Sanskrit than is at present usual at that stage, and possessed of the limited acquaintance with History, Geography and Mathematics necessary for the matriculation test, but ignorant of English. If, as the Vice-Chancellor anticipates, an increase to the number of undergraduates is thus obtained, the advantage will be but slight; for it is unlikely that students so prepared will be able to acquire sufficient mastery of English to enable them to pass the English tests of the subsequent examinations, or to use that language with freedom as the prescribed medium for passing in other subjects. In justice to those undergraduates, it will be necessary to give them the option of passing the

further examinations also in their vernacular. Indeed, when the propriety of adopting the vernacular as a medium of instruction up to the matriculation stage is once conceded, it is difficult to see any utility in gratuitously obstructing the student's progress by forcing upon him an untried foreign language as the vehicle of further study. The real requisite is a system of education by which a student shall not only be able to reach a high standard of information, but shall also be fitted from early and continued study of English for availing himself readily of its literary and scientific treasures. The former object is more easily attainable by teaching and exercising in the vernacular, and the latter by making the English language an obligatory subject in all the examinations, especially the earlier ones. The Vice-Chancellor, in lieu of Sir W. Muir's suggestion that students should be allowed to take up the classical Oriental languages for honors after passing the Middle or First Arts Examination, proposes "to give in all the examinations a somewhat higher value to the marks in these languages." If, as I understand, the subjects of the examinations are obligatory, and a student to pass at all must pass in each subject, the solitary inducement offered by this proposal is the hope of a somewhat higher place in the division list. Whether this attraction would have the effect of leading students to devote much more labor and time to the cultivation of these languages is, it may be feared, very doubtful. The cardinal objection to the present rule is, that, in consequence of the great falling off in the number of candidates between the middle and final examinations, it operates to exclude a considerable number of possible students for honors in those languages. If, then, the acquaintance with English literature and science requisite for passing the Middle Examination is sufficient to enable a student to have recourse with ease and freedom to the sources of more advanced information contained in the writings of the English language, it is clearly advisable to relax the stringency of the present rule in favor of those who may wish to take up Arabic or

Sanskrit for honors without waiting to pass the B. A. Examination.

My general conclusions are, that the existing practice of making English an obligatory subject at the Entrance Examination should not be disturbed; that at all the examinations candidates should have the option of passing in the vernacular; that students should, after passing the First Arts Examination, be allowed to devote themselves at once to the study of the oriental languages for honors; and that the creation of a branch Syndicate at Allahabad, to exercise the functions before specified, is eminently desirable.

4th May, 1870.

(Sd.) M. S. HOWELL.

MEMORANDUM No. 9.—*By* H. TEMPLETON, ESQ., *Principal, Bareilly College.*

I REGRET to say the general educational questions discussed in Mr. Bayley's pamphlet are such as have never before been carefully considered by me, and I consequently feel my views thereon can be of very little value. Nevertheless, in obedience to His Honor's order, I proceed to offer a few remarks in connection with those suggestions and propositions on which my long practical experience as a worker in the Department may have in some degree qualified me to form an opinion.

I think a convocation for conferring degrees to be held at Allahabad would be a desirable arrangement; believe it could be made with little difficulty, and would be very acceptable to those most concerned, the young men themselves, their parents and friends.

On the question whether the study of Oriental literature should meet with more encouragement, I remark there are very few indeed of the students of English who evince any desire to extend their knowledge either of the vernacular or classic tongues of India beyond the standards prescribed for the different examinations; and that the work (English and

Oriental) to be done for both Middle Arts and the B. A. tests is sufficiently difficult now, and would scarcely permit of candidates getting up more, or of qualifying themselves to supply the great want of the country—a Vernacular Literature. Again, as to qualifying *after* passing the Middle Arts Examination. English is studied principally for the material advantages it brings to such as make fair progress therein; and, from what has come under my own observation, I should say few youths who have passed the Middle Arts, or even the Entrance Examination, would afterwards take up the systematic study of an Oriental tongue, seeing that so large a portion of their time must be occupied in earning a livelihood if they leave College, or in prosecuting their studies if they remain. There appears, therefore, but little hope of advancing in any important degree the study of Oriental languages and literature amongst our English-learning pupils. Something perhaps might be done, might be gained, by a different arrangement or course in the Colleges, which would permit of a higher standard being required by the University. As it is, boys who have both at home and in class made good progress in Persian, are compelled to enter for Arabic, losing thereby much Persian already acquired, and, according to the best authorities I can consult on the subject, getting nothing worthy the name of scholarship in its place.

If my views are correct, the encouragement sought to be given to the study of the classical languages of India can only be given by prescribing a purely Oriental test—one which the learned natives themselves would acknowledge, one the passing of which would qualify for University distinctions, and bring something more than barren honor with it.

I entirely agree with Mr. Bayley that a very considerable number of those students now excluded from passing by any University standard, owing to the necessity of acquiring English, would qualify themselves for examination in the vernacular and classic languages of their own country, and pass

successfully by a far higher standard than any we now fix, the attainment of which would, as a means of mental training, be perhaps equally useful with the study of English up to Entrance test. I think that in the North-Western Provinces, where a change in kind of indigenous education is much wanted, a few years under the proposed system would give us much better teachers, and, through them, better books.

As regards the preparation of such works as would be required for the higher forms of vernacular literature. I presume with due encouragement exceptional men trained under the present system, who have taken honors or the B. A. degree (and some of whom may be excellent Oriental scholars besides), would be found as willing as competent to the task.

Could any part of the examinations be conducted in the vernaculars? I think very little would be gained by introducing more of the vernacular into present examinations, believing that the acquirement and use of English are the great objects of attraction to our pupils. Any change, short of that very complete one of teaching English as a language only, giving History, Philosophy and Mathematics in the vernacular, would be of little practical use.

The 6th May, 1870. (Sd.) H. TEMPLETON,
Principal, Bareilly College.

MEMORANDUM No. 10.—*By A. S. HARRISON, Esq., Professor of Mathematics, Bareilly College.*

THE questions to which I particularly address myself, as being the salient points noted in the Vice-Chancellor's Minute, are:—

1. Is a separate University for the North-Western Provinces necessary or desirable?

2. If a distinct one is not (at any rate now) required, what constitutional or administrative changes would render the existing University more effective and acceptable to outlying provinces?

3. The propositions of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor regarding degrees in Oriental Classics and teaching Science in the vernacular.

Though the whole subject, as particularly interesting to me, has had my long and earnest attention, and I have a good many years' experience in the working of the systems previous and subsequent to the foundation of the University, yet I submit my views with great deference, as being possibly bounded by a certain narrowness, from having constantly looked at the matter from the one side of a worker out of details, not as the originator of a scheme.

On the first point I feel very strongly. With separate Universities at Calcutta, Allahabad, Lucknow, Lahore, and perhaps even elsewhere (for the establishment of the second implies the gradual formation of others), a diminished honor and dignity would attend the degrees conferred by each, which no amount of emulation or generous rivalry between them could compensate. Far greater renown will ever attach to the distinctions granted by a single University embracing all the provinces: indeed, as long as it remains the only one, the University loses all provincial character, and is and will be regarded not as that of Bengal Proper, but as an Imperial one placed at the seat of the Imperial Government. I need hardly draw an illustration from the comparatively mean estimation in which we hold degrees obtained at the many Universities of Germany, that land of scholars.

Our position in these parts differs altogether from that of Bombay or of Madras. Those provinces throughout history have from the first been separate in administration and intercourse,—a separation which late years of centralisation have failed to efface. But the bond linking Bengal and these provinces, always close and intimate, is daily being drawn still closer by that increasing facility of communication which has not yet by any means reached its limits. Why then should we part in the matter of the University except for the most cogent reasons? And, moreover, without any detraction, I

may remark that the success of the Madras and Bombay Universities is not so pronounced as to favor the establishment of new ones elsewhere on light grounds.

As, therefore, I see heavy disadvantages are likely to follow dissociation, without any compensating gains, I would contend for the unity of the University being maintained, even if inconveniences arise greater than any now foreseen. A little concession, hitherto not withheld as far as I am aware, will from time to time remove all such inconveniences, and even some difficulties of a serious nature. The supreme object of imparting a large amount of European learning to its immediate alumni, and spreading the same in a lower degree but far more widely through their agency—an object to which all others are subordinate—is a common foundation on which we all build, and assuredly most effectually and solidly when we build together.

But supposing the present University only to remain, what concessions to secure the interests of the North-West and other provinces may fairly be claimed? These I take to be the following :—

1. Adequate representation in the Senate.
2. Evidence from time to time which shall make it manifest to the people of any province that the University belongs also in a measure to them.
3. The removal of such disabilities as would place the students of any province at a disadvantage.

As to the first, the creation of a number of Fellows, and the introduction of such a plan as that suggested by the Vice-Chancellor, by which their views may obtain a fair hearing, and their votes (by proxy) carry a due weight in the decision of all important matters, will, in my judgment, sufficiently protect the peculiar interests of any province, and shut out any possible localizing tendency in the Councils of the University.

For the second, the Vice-Chancellor adequately provides by his proposal to hold convocations for conferring degrees

at Allahabad (and I presume, if necessary, elsewhere also). As on such occasions the Fellows attending will be chiefly those belonging to the province, the impression conveyed to the natives present will be that of a domestic, and not of a foreign, University.

If in such convocations the Chancellor himself presided, or if in his absence the Lieutenant-Governor were appointed by statute to be *ex-officio* the Chancellor's representative, nothing desirable to the dignity of the ceremony would be wanting.

As to the thirds; students in outlying provinces up to last year certainly did labor under a great disadvantage in having to proceed to Calcutta for the distinctive examination for degrees and honors. But the Senate, on representation being made, acceded to the proposal to hold these examinations in the North-Western Provinces and the Punjab; thereby affording proof, were any necessary, that the interests of distant provinces should not suffer when a remedy could be pointed out. A farther disability which still remains will be taken away by holding convocations for degrees at places other than Calcutta, which has already been proposed in the Vice-Chancellor's Minute; in which he also instances the practice (on more than one occasion) of consulting the views of those interested in these parts on proposed alterations in the course of study—a farther evidence of catholic feeling on the part of the Senate.

That the University should have its seat in Calcutta as long as the Imperial Government also remains there, I regard as a necessary consequence, and not productive of any serious evil.

The impression on my mind is, that the University, though founded in Calcutta, has unconsciously acted and grown as if it were an Imperial one,—at least as far as we are concerned. Our Colleges and High Schools have sought and

found affiliation; their Principals have been consulted in matters affecting these Colleges; examiners have been appointed without distinction both from the North-West and the Punjab; indeed it is probable that the Senate would be glad to see a larger number of applicants for that onerous task coming forward from those parts; and I cannot adduce an instance where a proposition, which would stand a chance of being entertained in a Senate in which we were fully represented, has been rejected by that body.

It is certainly true that hitherto we have had but few in the Degree, and fewer still in the Honor lists; but I should not attribute this circumstance so much to our not being represented officially in the University as to other causes, of which two are: the early period at which our students leave for profitable employment, which can be obtained more easily and on lower acquirements here than now in Bengal, and notably that as yet the children of the aristocracy in these parts have only exceptionally attended our Colleges and Schools. Both these drawbacks to the number of our distinguished pupils formerly existed also in Calcutta, and as there, so also here, they will of themselves gradually disappear; and I do not see how the existence of a separate University in these provinces would much accelerate the process.

The third topic is the encouragement of Oriental studies apart from English. The ultimate aim of the University in this respect is not so much the simple instruction of the comparatively few, who, in its affiliated Colleges and Schools, are primarily and directly affected by it, as the general advancement of learning among the whole people, or, as declared by His Honor to be, to create for the masses, who cannot acquire English, a vernacular literature,—*i. e.*, “works in History, Art and Science containing sound knowledge, written in an elegant style, and composed on models of thought and expression agreeable to the native mind,” for the preparation of which, particularly in regard to the last

and most important feature, we must look to our students, who alone, having had access to the original sources of knowledge by the acquisition of English, are competent to produce such works. I may incidentally remark that to the rich alone, as a body, is the requisite learned leisure possible—another reason why the upper classes should be drawn into our Colleges by all means short of compulsion. And I may also digress to remark how unreasonable is the clamour lately raised by some who, unable to grasp the whole subject, contend that our endeavours should be mainly if not entirely devoted to the more elementary education of the masses, and that we should withdraw from expensive and unprofitable Colleges. Those who thus argue do not perceive that it is only through the more highly educated natives alone we can hope effectually to reach the minds of the masses; and unless we provide the former, the status of the latter must remain much as it now is. The fallacy has long since been acknowledged in regard to missions, but is still maintained in discussions on education.

But to return. Our difficulties in creating this vernacular literature are peculiarly enhanced under our present University system, in which, the students learn only English and one of the Oriental classical tongues. For whatever may be the psychological doctrine, all men allow that practically our thoughts are mentally clothed in language, or we think in words. Our system, therefore, forces our students to invest their thoughts in an English garb, and gives very little if any assistance whatever towards the aim above declared. Again, further, it requires students to take up Science

* “No one is master of a language long before they have that until he can think in it.”—*Spiers*. mastery* of English which is necessary for the comprehension of any process of reasoning. I refer of course to the attainments required of students in the Entrance Examination in Geometry and Algebra.

I should therefore cordially welcome such a change in part as suggested by the Lieutenant-Governor, which would

permit the mathematical portion of the Entrance Examination to be held in the vernacular, optionally. And I believe we should thereby secure a double gain, in accustoming our students to think in their own vernacular, and in the earlier and more complete comprehension of strict processes of reasoning. And I do not anticipate any insurmountable difficulty either as to books or examiners, though our series of the first is far from being perfect, or of a like high character for method and precision with the English ones now read, and it would no doubt be necessary to appoint different examiners for students using Bengalee and those writing Ordoos or Hindee. But perhaps the time is not far distant when the Entrance Examination may be altogether dis severed from the University, and left, as the corresponding preliminary Examinations at Oxford and Cambridge, either to individual colleges and their associated schools, or at least to the conjoint Colleges of a province, setting the University free to deal with that which more immediately concerns it—*viz.*, the conferring degrees and holding the intermediate examinations. The danger of the University breaking up from the unwieldy aggregate of candidates for entrance (*mole ruit sua*) which has been contemplated would be thus entirely avoided. If one-half of the fees levied for entrance were still devoted to the University chest, whilst the other was applied to defray the expenses of the provincial examination, all difficulties of a financial nature might be obviated.

But as to any further permissive use of the vernaculars at higher examinations, or the substitution of Oriental literature for any part of the subsequent University course, I should hesitate to put forward an opinion; yet this much would I declare, that I should be opposed to giving up on any consideration the English literature portion of the requirements of the B. A. degree. Whether a prescribed selection of Oriental classics might be allowed to replace one or more of the other branches of study in the course—*e. g.*, History, Psychology or Mathematics, wholly or in part—is a matter

which only full and ample discussion in the Senate could justly decide. It savours (to me) of retrogression, but the question is one on which individual opinions and proclivities are likely to be strong and unreasonable, until attempered by the attrition of many views, and therefore one the more to be guarded against. Also the change is so important that many, though not unfavorable to it, might hesitate to accord the sanction of their vote except under the conviction of a tolerably decided consensus.

(Sd.) A. S. HARRISON,

May 6th, 1870.

Professor of Mathematics,
Barcilly College.

MEMORANDUM No. 11.—*By W. JARDINE, Esq., Professor of Law, N.-W. P., and Member of Senate, Calcutta University.*

As to the proposal to establish a Branch Syndicate at Allahabad, if that Syndicate was intended to exercise functions similar to those of the present Syndicate at Calcutta, and especially if it were proposed to hold separate provincial examinations under the direction of the Syndicate, I think the Vice-Chancellor is right in considering it impracticable. So long as we maintain our connection with the University of Calcutta we must submit to the inconvenience of having no examinations especially suited to our own peculiar wants. The title of B. A. of the Calcutta University could hardly be applied with propriety to a man who had been examined here by a local Committee, in accordance with a distinct educational scheme of their own. It would be more straightforward to call him a B. A. of Allahabad. In short, I think, the effect of the proposal made to the Vice-Chancellor would be virtually to establish a separate University without the name, and to claim whatever prestige may be thought to accrue from connection with a large University without the right.

The proposal of the Vice-Chancellor to give more power in the Senate to non-resident members seems worthy of trial.

A month and not six weeks would, I think, be long enough notice to enable them to vote on important matters.

The paucity of Fellows in these Provinces demands attention. Probably there are not more than ten or twelve. I think the number might usefully be increased by the addition of residents of Allahabad and neighbouring places. I say this upon the same principle which has hitherto dictated the nomination of residents of Calcutta. The members of the Senate in the North-Western Provinces might then conveniently meet for deliberation and recommendation, but I do not think it would be necessary to alter the mode of our direct influence in the Senate except by the proposed circulation of the proceedings of that body and the privilege of voting by letter.

The proposal of the Lieutenant-Governor that a convocation should be held at Allahabad is, I think, a very wise one. The attendance of the Vice-Chancellor and the Registrar may be desirable, but surely not indispensable. The place of the Vice-Chancellor might be taken in his absence by the Senior Member of the Senate present—a course which I have seen adopted in the Senate of the University of London. In these Provinces the Lieutenant-Governor would usually be the Senior Member.

I turn to the more important and more difficult questions which relate to the extent and the mode in which the University should encourage the teaching of Oriental literature. I shall not attempt to enter at large into the consideration of the issues which are thus raised. It is through the medium of English and of English alone that any education worthy of the name is now to be obtained in India. I do not think this state of things will be materially changed until there shall have been created a body of learned natives familiar with the English language and to some extent acquainted with the vast stores of information and thought to which that language is the key. By their agency, a revival of learning may be induced through the native tongue; but the time is not yet.

I think there is always a considerable danger of allowing what is really a great social problem to degenerate into a mere linguistic problem. It is not a style and a taste moulded upon the master-pieces of Persian and Sanskrit poetry that the people of India need. It is rather that they should be introduced to a truer science, a higher morality, and a more inspiring history than their own. With these views, I have but little sympathy with any efforts to encourage Oriental literature. At present I think all such studies are almost worse than useless. But I am aware that there is a strong attachment to such studies in the minds of many native gentlemen, and I would make some concession even to what I may consider prejudice.

If it be conceded that some encouragement should be given to Oriental students, I do not approve the plan proposed by the Vice-Chancellor. It is unreasonable to allow a boy to pass the Entrance Examination without knowing English, and then to prevent his proceeding further until he has learned it. The effect will practically be that candidates will present themselves for the First Arts Examination worse prepared in English than they now are, and that is saying a good deal. There ought to be no *upper* limit to the distinctions to be gained in vernacular only. Either let there be a series of examinations in the vernacular throughout, or else, having secured in the lower examinations a certain degree of proficiency in English, let the students seek for higher distinction by exceptional excellence in Oriental languages. This last is Sir William Muir's proposal, and I agree with it, except that I should be disposed to leave things as they are as far as the B. A. degree, and then allow honors or an M. A. degree to be obtained by proficiency in Oriental studies.

(Sd.) W. JARDINE,

ALLAHABAD :
10th May, 1870. } Professor of Law, N.-W. P., & Member of the Senate, Calcutta University.

MEMORANDUM No. 12.—By REVd. C. E. VINES, *Principal of St. John's College, Agra.*

1. It is true that the *premature* establishment of a University at Allahabad, for the North-Western Provinces, Ōudh, &c., might, by reason of the contrast which it would present to the vast proportions of the Calcutta University (taking into consideration the numbers presenting themselves for examination), give rise to the idea that the degree was of inferior value; and in that case the cause of education within the sphere of its influence would suffer, and many would be led to seek the Calcutta University degree in preference, whereby the object of its foundation would be defeated. Still, it appears to me that there are sufficient reasons why there should be a distinct University at an early date; and, as a preliminary to this, I should like to see a branch of the Syndicate of the Calcutta University meeting at Allahabad, having full powers for the arrangement of studies and conduct of examinations, so far as they affect peculiarly and exclusively these provinces.

2. I prefer the proposal for a branch of the Syndicate at Allahabad, with full powers, to the plan of correspondence between Fellows representing these Provinces and those in Calcutta. The members of the Senate in Calcutta will many of them regard educational questions from a narrower point of view than it is probable the representative Fellows of these provinces would. The limited experience gained in Calcutta and its immediate neighbourhood will be the test by which the Minutes transmitted from these Provinces will be tried. That this is the case with the Syndicate may be seen by a reference to the lists of the members in present and past years.

3. At present the study of vernacular and English does not proceed, as a fact, *pari passu*. One is sacrificed to the other. The present scheme of education is, I suppose, only provisional. It cannot be considered national, or worthy to be such, until the vernacular occupies its proper position

as the vehicle of teaching Sciences and Arts. And yet the time has not come when any great changes can be effected. To watch the time and amount of change required is the work of a local body--i. e., one acquainted with and resident in the provinces which will be affected by proposed changes.

4. The plan of substituting Arabic and Sanskrit for vernacular languages in the higher examinations of the University has perhaps affected injuriously the study of the vernaculars by compelling our students to commence the study of these languages in preference to vernaculars, at an earlier age than was before usual (they commence these languages from the 4th Class of the School Department).

5. The discussion of this question is complicated by the difficulty of finding suitable books in the vernaculars (I speak more especially of Oordoo than Hindee, which is less studied in this part of the country); and this introduces another subject that can be best discussed by Europeans and intelligent natives conversant with educational questions, as they affect the natives of these provinces. The University of Calcutta discarded a book of Oordoo Extracts in 1865 which was complained of as containing grossly obscene passages. Yet I am told that selections from the poetical portion, which was the *Mussnavi* of Meer Hussun, might be read without moral injury to the students; and that the poem, from the high place it occupies in Oordoo poetical literature, ought not to be altogether discarded. The present book of Extracts in Oordoo retained for the last few years is not so objectionable; but some parts of the poetical portion are complained of, and they might be excused without injury to the whole.